

INTRODUCTION

Modernism reveals a period of crisis in the history of humanity which coincides first half of the twentieth century. The age of modernist art represents the last part of the modern period when considering the modern period as beginning with Renaissance (artistic line) or with the 17th century (philosophical line, for instance, Descartes) and as ending in crisis, non-accomplishment, and failure.

Adding the modernist concern with individual psychological and spiritual experience and the modernist attempt to achieve originality on both thematic and structural levels of the literary discourse, we have a number of texts as short stories – that is, *Dubliners* – which present the condition of modern man as comprising four main aspects: childhood, adolescence, maturity and public life.

The chronotope of the city in *Dubliners* as conceived by James Joyce reveals a background and a temporal dimension characterized by paralysis, staticism, and devaluation, and inhabited by subjects, not individuals, unable to establish relations and, therefore unable to rise above their pathetic condition. In this case, Joyce's characters from the stories truly represent modern frustrated and alienated beings.

In this respect, epiphany is employed as both a thematic and structural device aimed at offering to the characters the possibility to understand their condition and, above all, to decide on whether improve it or not.

In this case, epiphany – as a literary device employed by Joyce – corresponds to his theoretical perspectives which are based on Thomas Aquinas' consideration of the condition of beauty and which are not expressed by Joyce in extended critical and theoretical texts, but mainly through the voice of his alter-ego Stephen starting with the autobiographical fragment *Stephen Hero*, in which Joyce himself defines the term through the voice of his character alter-ego:

By an epiphany he meant a sudden spiritual manifestation, whether in the vulgarity of speech or of gesture or in a memorable phase of the mind itself. (Joyce, 1963, p. 211).

According to Thomas Aquinas there are three stages of beauty: “integritas”, “consonantia”, and “claritas” – which could be rendered in English by “wholeness”, “harmony” and “radiance”. While Joyce uses his epiphanies in his stories, he corresponds to Aquinas’ stages.

The present thesis is to discuss in detail the epiphanies used in *Dubliners* following the attempt to define and provide acceptance of the term from within the contribution of both literary theoreticians and practitioners. Besides, this thesis holds the purpose of explaining the epiphanies in all 15 short stories, with a special focus on *The Sisters*, *Araby*, *A Painful Case*, and *The Dead*, and a particular emphasis on the character representation strategies as applied by the modernist writer to achieve the spiritual and psychological concern regarding the growth, progress, frustration, alienation, regress, failure, triviality, and other aspects of the human condition in a period of crisis and paralysis in the history of humanity.

In in doing so, we embark on a critical endeavour reified and sustained by the methodological system provided, among others, by comparative approach and thematology.

CHAPTER 1

JAMES JOYCE AND *DUBLINERS*

James Augustine Aloysius Joyce, an Irish poet and novelist, is one of the most important avant-garde writers of European Modernism. Throughout his life, he constantly felt in exile. He never felt himself belong to somewhere. He felt to be in exile not only in Trieste but also in Zurich and even in Dublin, which he left bearing the thought that the city was totally paralyzed. This paralysis is not only in thought but also in senses. James Joyce moved many times as his father John Stanislaus Joyce did. His habit seems to have been inherited from his father. His constant changing as if he had been on the move sometimes resulted by his deep frustrations about the publications of his books. However, his moving once gained one of the best known telegraphs in world of literature: his mother's telegram deeply affected him. He always felt himself guilty as clearly revealed in his masterpiece *Ulysses*.

Dublin, which was a doomed place for James Joyce, was the setting for his short story book *Dubliners*, consisting of fifteen stories. It wasn't easy to be published and took nearly ten years for him to publish it. In the second half of 1904 his first stories appeared: *The Sisters*. Originally James Joyce had ten stories in his mind. His designing imagination, however, immediately conceived of *The Sisters* as the first of 'a series of epicleti-ten' which he already called *Dubliners* 'to betray the soul of that hemiplegia or paralysis which many consider a city'. Epicleti referred to the prayer of the Orthodox Church in which the Holy Ghost is invoked to transmute bread and wine into the body and blood of Christ (Anderson, 1998 p. 52).

The first ten stories in his mind were *The Sisters*, *An Encounter*, *The Boarding House*, *After The Race*, *Eveline*, *Clay*, *Counterparts*, *A Painful Case*, *Ivy Day In The Committee Room*, and *The Mother*. In a letter to his brother Stanislaus Joyce in 1905, Joyce disclosed his intend to write twelve stories in four main sections

contrary to his first intention to write ten stories (Walzl, 1977). In a letter to Grant Richardson, his publisher, James Joyce wrote:

My intention was to write a chapter of the moral history of my country and I have tried to present it to the indifferent public under four of its aspects: childhood, adolescence, maturity and public life. The stories are arranged in this order. I have written it for the most part of in a style of scrupulous meanness and with the conviction that he is a very bold man who dares to alter in the presentment, still more to deform whatever he has seen and heard (Joyce cited in Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006, p. 46).

By adding *Araby* and *Grace*, Joyce completed the book to twelve stories as he wrote to his brother. Afterwards by adding *Two Gallants*, *A Little Cloud* in 1906, he finished fourteen stories in total. Finally by writing *The Dead*, which is much more detailed when compared the rest of the stories, he completed his stories to fifteen. These stories represent four phases. To be more precise, *The Sisters*, *An Encounter* and *Araby* are full of memories of childhood whereas *Eveline*, *After The Race*, *Two Gallants* and *The Boarding House* and put in experiences of adolescence. As for third cycle for maturity, *A Little Cloud*, *Counterparts*, *Clay* and *A Painful Case* were added. The last division for the first version of the *Dubliners* about the Dublin's Life consisted of *Ivy Day in the Committee Room*, *A Mother*, *Grace* and *The Dead*, which took three years (1904-1907) to complete his *Dubliners*. As what is death in life circle, *The Dead* was embedded to the *Dubliners*. As Friedrich and Walzl expound these fifteen stories provide an organic sequence of life and although he didn't intend to write fifteen stories at first, the stories he added later complements the book as a whole (Friedrich & Walzl, 1961).

As far as the publication process is concerned, although it took three years to write the book, it took nearly ten years to reach his aim to publish it. His collection of short stories, *Dubliners*, on which he had been working since 1904, was finally published on 15 June 1914. The long publication process -let's say battle- resulted in frustration as his book sold 499 copies while the royalties for the book would be paid after 500 copies based on the contract with Grant Richards, but following years

didn't help James Joyce to grant money since the number of copies sold decreased (Anderson, 1998).

CHAPTER 2

EPIPHANY WITHIN AND BEYOND LITERARY PRACTICE

2.1 Definition and acceptance of the term

The term “epiphany” comes from the word “epiphaneia” in Greek mythology meaning “appearing” or “appearance” about gods. “It is used usually with reference to the gods, pertaining to their miracles, their accession to Mount Olympus to be with the Greek pantheon, or to their return to earth” (Hays & Duvall & Pate, 2007, p. 60). It suggests a phenomenon that emphasizes the visibility of a hidden sacred. “It can be either in the form of a personal appearance, or by some deed of power by which its presence is made known” (Arndt & Gingrich & Danker, 1956, p. 630).

Moreover; the term “epiphaneia” is used in the New Testament as follows:

“And then the lawless one will be revealed (apokalupsis), and the Lord Jesus will slay him with the breath of his mouth and destroy him by his appearing (epiphaneia) and his coming (parousia).” (2 Thess. 2:8-10). “but now has been made known through the appearing (epiphaneias) of our Savior, Christ Jesus, on the one hand, in order to abolish death and, on the other, to bring to light life and incorruptibility through the gospel” (2 Timothy 1:10). “I solemnly charge you in the presence of God and Christ Jesus, who is about to judge the living and the dead, and by his appearing and by his kingdom:” (2 Timothy 4:1). “Now is reserved for me the crown of righteousness, which the Lord, the righteous judge, will give to me on that Day, but not only to me but also to everyone who has loved his appearing (epiphaneian)” 2 Timothy 4:8). “waiting for the blessed hope, the appearing (epiphaneian) of the glory of our great God and Savior Jesus Christ” (Titus 2:13).

“Epiphaneia” in the New Testament refers to Christ’s second coming to the earth. This second coming, “epiphaneia”, will be the destruction for the lawless one. However, there is an exception to the meaning in (2 Timothy 1:10) “where epiphaneia describes the first coming of Christ, whose death and resurrection have

made more clear the reality of the immortality of the Christian” (Hays & Duvall & Pate, 2007, p. 50).

In Christian tradition, the feast following the twelve days of Christmas (the 6th of January) is called Epiphany. It is the celebration of the revelation of divinity of Christ’s divinity to the Magi (wise men). The West Church starts to celebrate it in the 4th century. On the other hand, it signifies another event when St John the Baptist baptized Jesus.

As for James Joyce’s use of epiphany, he disparately uses them in a secular way by leaving aside its divine connotation as Öğretir suggests (Öğretir, 2005). Only in the story *The Dead*, he emerges his secular usage of epiphany, which leads a revelation, and its divine usage, 6th of January. His first practical use of epiphanies goes back to before his writing *Dubliners*. Unlike his use of epiphanies in *Dubliners*, his first epiphanies are separate paragraphs or dialogues that are not even one page long. However, in the essence these short paragraphs or dialogues provide a revelation. It is known that Joyce has written seventy one epiphanies from 1901 to 1904, but only forty of them have survived. His brother, Stanislaus Joyce, mentions these epiphanies in his book:

Another experimental form which his literary urge took while we were living at this address consisted in the noting of what he called “epiphanies” – manifestations or revelations. Jim always had a contempt for secrecy, and these notes were in the beginning ironical observations of slips, and little errors and gestures- mere straws in the wind- by which people betrayed the very things they were most careful to conceal. Epiphanies were always brief sketches, hardly ever more than some dozen lines in length, but always very accurately observed and noted, the matter being so slight..... The revelation and importance of the subconscious had caught his interest. The epiphanies became more frequently subjective and included dreams which he considered in some way revelatory (Joyce, 2003, pp. 124-125).

Some critics have the opinion that the reason why James Joyce’s only forty epiphanies out of seventy-one survives is that Joyce has destroyed thirty one of them

on purposely because of his using them in *Dubliners*. We reckon upon Stanislaus' statements since some of them have been copied by him. On the other hand, Ilaria Natali suggests an assumption about James Joyce's first epiphanies as paragraphs or dialogues:

As a matter of fact, Stanislaus might have copied James' epiphanies with different criteria, thus we cannot be sure that he respected authorial choices. The reasons why he transcribed the texts are unclear, as also the function and meaning they had for him; It is evident, for example, that he selected only narrative sketches, probably out of personal preference (Natalia, 2011, p. 9).

It seems not possible to claim that these forty epiphanies have originally been written by James Joyce as these texts might have been changed or chosen by personal criteria.

As regards James Joyce's adaptation of epiphany, there is scarce information about it. We rely on his own description on epiphany. In the *Stephen Hero*, which is the early version of *A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man*, he renders his own description:

A young lady was standing on the steps of one of those brown brick houses which seem the very incarnation of Irish paralysis. A young gentleman was leaning on the rusty railings of the area. Stephen as he passed on his quest heard the following fragment of colloquy out of which he received an impression keen enough to afflict his sensitiveness very severely.

The Young Lady - (drawling discreetly) ... O, yes... I at the ...cha...pel...
 The Young Gentleman - (inaudibly) ... I ... (again inaudibly) ... I
 The Young Lady - (softly) .O... but you're ... ve....ry... wick...ed...

This triviality made him think of collecting many such moments together in a book of epiphanies. By an epiphany he meant a sudden spiritual manifestation, whether in the vulgarity of speech or of gesture or in a memorable phase of the mind itself. He believed that it was for the man of letters to record these epiphanies with extreme care, seeing that they themselves are the most delicate and evanescent of moments. (Joyce, 1963, p. 211).

According to Ellmann et al. Stephen makes a distinction “the vulgarity of speech or of gesture”, which means dramatic epiphany and “a memorable phase of the mind itself”, which means lyrical epiphany, thus they emphasize the “twin poles” of James Joyce’s use of epiphany as “dramatic irony” and “lyric sentiment” (Ellmann & Litz & Ferguson, 1991, p. 158).

The mostly widespread meaning of Epiphany refers to a moment when a person lives through a realization in which s/he understands the condition. Epiphany is a sudden revelation of the truth. It is a moment of insight or comprehension of something, which changes the outlook of the person realizing it. It is also a discovery for which a journey to the inner world is required. However, in *Dubliners* there is no hint that there is a shift in the life of the character in *Dubliners*. Beja defines epiphany as:

a sudden spiritual manifestation, whether from some object, scene, event, or memorable phase of the mind--the manifestation being out of proportion to the significance or strictly logical relevance of whatever produces it (Beja, 1971, p. 18).

In the hands of Joyce, Epiphany is also an artistic comprehension. Here it is best to refer again to *Stephen Hero*:

-Imagine my glimpses at that clock as the gropings of a spiritual eye which seeks to adjust its vision to an exact focus. The moment the focus is reached the object is epiphanised. It is just in this epiphany that I find the third, the supreme quality of beauty.

-Yes? said Cranly absently.

-No esthetic theory, pursued Stephen relentlessly, is of any value which investigates with the aid of the lantern of tradition. What we symbolise in black the Chinaman may symbolise in yellow: each has his own tradition. Greek beauty laughs at Coptic beauty and the American Indian derides them both. It is almost impossible to reconcile all tradition whereas it is by no means impossible to find the justification of every form of beauty which has ever been adored on the earth by an examination into the mechanism of esthetic apprehension whether it be dressed in red, white, yellow or black. We have no reason for thinking that the Chinaman has a different system of

digestion from that which we have though our diets are quite dissimilar. The apprehensive faculty must be scrutinised in action.

-Yes ...

-You know what Aquinas says: The three things requisite for beauty are, integrity, a wholeness, symmetry and radiance. Some day I will expand that sentence into a treatise. Consider the performance of your own mind when confronted with any object, hypothetically beautiful. Your mind to apprehend that object divides the entire universe into two parts, the object, and the void which is not the object. To apprehend it you must lift it away from everything else: and then you perceive that it is one integral thing, that is a thing. You recognise its integrity. Isn't that so?

-And then?

-That is the first quality of beauty: it is declared in a simple sudden synthesis of the faculty which apprehends. What then? Analysis then. The mind considers the object in whole and in part, in relation to itself and to other objects, examines the balance of its parts, contemplates the form of the object, traverses every cranny of the structure. So the mind receives the impression of the symmetry of the object. The mind recognises that the object is in the strict sense of the word, a thing, a definitely constituted entity. You see?

-Let us turn back, said Cranly.

They had reached the corner of Grafton St and as the footpath was overcrowded they turned back northwards. Cranly had an inclination to watch the antics of a drunkard who had been ejected from a bar in Suffolk St but Stephen took his arm summarily and led him away.

For a long time I couldn't make out what Aquinas meant. He uses a figurative word (a very unusual thing for him) but I have solved it. *Claritas* is *quidditas*. After the analysis which discovers the second quality the mind makes the only logically possible synthesis and discovers the third quality. This is the moment which I call epiphany. First we recognise that the object is one integral thing, and then we recognize that it is an organized composite structure, a thing in fact: finally, when the relation of the parts is exquisite, when the parts are adjusted to the special point, we recognize that it is that thing which it is. The soul of the commonest object seems to us radiant. The object achieves its epiphany (Joyce, 1963, pp. 212-213).

From Stephen Hero it is clear that for James Joyce's epiphany is a part of beauty. In this respect, his aesthetic consideration of using epiphany brings Joyce's together with Walter Pater's. On the other hand, it is evident that Pater's and Joyce's

aesthetic considerations are reminiscent but they differ from each other in many respects. Pater's aesthetic consideration is more deeply rooted. Pater esteems that art is in the first place as he thinks "art for art's sake". Golban draws attention to Pater's consideration of art:

It is art where the finest sensations are to be found and where the human existence has the possibility of preserving the intense but fleeting moments of experience man should strive to purify his sensations (Golban, 2008, p. 104).

In this respect, whereas Pater's aesthetic is the source of his thoughts, Joyce's aesthetic is discovered by an epiphanic moment. His characters embark on the key role. The success results from Joyce's choice of interference with his characters. Perlis suggests that Joyce doesn't want any intervention by subjectivism and wants to "allow objects to achieve a radiant life of their own" (Perlis, 1980, p. 275). This means that his characters are not the centre of everything rather they are only objects in their ordinary lives. However, as Joyce allows them to live through their own experiences, his characters reveal beauty with their epiphanic moments.

To sum up, James Joyce is inspired by many conceptions while constructing his original epiphany. The conceptions such as "spot of time", "aesthetic value", "fleeting moments", "purifying sensations" and "whatness" are all parts of Joyce's epiphany, which signifies its accumulation from religious origins through Romantic poets and aesthetic considerations.

2.2 Practitioners on Epiphany

Although epiphany is generally concerned to be used only by modernist writers, its first use goes back to Romantic poets. Barfoot defines epiphany in three “senses” which are the same in essence: The first one is “ecclesiastical provenance”, which is directly related to divinity. The second one is James Joyce’s use of it by discovering a universal truth in ordinary but an important discovery. The third one finding something that is likened to epiphany: “alight on the sense of an experience” (Barfoot, 1999, p. 61). Romantic poets might be in the third sense. Romantic poets, especially through nature tried to find of essence of living which provided experiences and realization and these are different from James Joyce’s adding aesthetic conception.

In this respect, Wim Tigges thinks that there is a link between Romantic Poets and James Joyce. He emphasizes the usage and importance of “the notion of time” in Wordsworth, Blake, Shelly and Emerson (Tigges, 1999). According to Robert Langbaum “spot of time”, which was used by William Wordsworth in *The Prelude* was the one century early form of epiphany (Langbaum, in Tigges, 1999):

There are in our existence spots of time,
That with distinct pre-eminence retain
A renovating virtue, whence—depressed
By false opinion and contentious thought,
Or aught of heavier or more deadly weight,
In trivial occupations, and the round
Of ordinary intercourse—our minds
Are nourished and invisibly repaired;
A virtue, by which pleasure is enhanced,
That penetrates, enables us to mount,
When high, more high, and lifts us up when fallen.

To be more precise, we think that it is better to refer to Wordsworth's consideration of poetry. As Golban suggests, Wordsworth takes the purpose of poetry in three types: pleasure, knowledge and moral concerns. This means that Wordsworth takes not only individual but also moral codes. He combines emotion and rational with moral considerations. On the other hand, Wordsworth as Golban specifies puts emphasis on knowledge: "the understanding of the Reader must necessarily be in some enlightened" (Golban, 2008, p. 84). When we move from the point of enlightenment it is possible to trace back to Wordsworth for the use of epiphany in essence. Also, moral concerns are embedded in Joyce's works.

Another Romantic Poet, Ralph Waldo Emerson also touches on epiphany:

Day creeps after day, each full of facts, dull strange, despised things, that we cannot enough despise, - call heavy, prosaic and desert. The time we seek to kill: the attention it is elegant to divert from things around us. And presently the aroused intellect finds gold and gems in one of these scorned facts, - then finds that the day of facts is a rock of diamonds; that a fact is an Epiphany of God (Emerson, 1960, p. 90).

Emerson seems to have correlated a philosophical point of view. His realization is rather a general attitude and seems to have been gained through accumulating experiences. When compared to other Romantic poets, Wordsworth's "spot of time" bears the most resemblance as it signifies moment as James Joyce emphasizes.

Regarding James Joyce's contemporary writers such as Virginia Woolf, Joseph Conrad, Marcel Proust, William Faulkner, Katherine Mansfield and George Eliot they also use epiphany in their works.

To illustrate, George Eliot uses epiphany in *Middlemarch* by her character Dorothea Brooke. Kim suggests that Eliot's use of epiphany is linked to "Dorothea's

Bildung". Kim explains Eliot's epiphany by pointing its propriety to the development of character:

Eliot's use of epiphany in has an unusual relation to similar novels of development. Strangely, although both male and female authors report epiphanies in Puritan autobiography, epiphany seems more common to women in the bildungsroman genre. As they identify distinctive traits of the female bildungsroman, Elizabeth Abel, Marianne Hirsch, and Elizabeth Langland observe that "development may be compressed into brief epiphanic moments. Since the significant changes are internal, flashes of recognition often replace the continuous unfolding of an action (Kim, 2012. p. 75).

Whereas Eliot's use of it suggests a development in character, which makes them round characters, Joyce's characters mostly do not present a development.

In Marcel Proust's "Remembrance of Times Past" a series of epiphanies are presented through the end of the book by encountering a number of death experiences. Proust never mentions the term epiphany, instead, he uses "incarnation, manifestation, revelation and resurrection" (Kearney, 2005, p. 12).

Virginia Woolf, one of the best known writers in the twentieth century, is the representative of experimental novel. As modernist writers, Virginia Woolf and James Joyce are experimental and innovative on both structural and thematic levels. On structural level Woolf uses "stream of consciousness" technique as James Joyce does. The technique is used in the form of interior monologue as the abstract manifestation of the mind through which an idea, a memory, a wish, feeling, remembrance an event or experience with the help of contact with reality and subconscious. Moreover; Joyce and Woolf both raise "stream of consciousness" technique to the artistic perfection. Woolf name doesn't use word "epiphany" but uses "a moment of importance", expressing a mental expression. According to Ma they both use the external impact on their characters' minds; they reveal an understanding or revelation without giving any comment (MA, 2011). As the

essence of stream of consciousness, thoughts are running fluidly and they are never constricted by any grammatical rules. Resulted from free association, thoughts are not interfered or commented by the writer as they are in reality.

James Joyce's epiphanies bear a contrast with Virginia Woolf's use of epiphanies. Ma states three differences between "epiphany" and "moment of importance". The first difference is that whereas the former sticks to the plot of the story, the latter embodies the characteristics of promptness, randomness and fragmentation. The second one refers to epiphany as it forms the climax of the story which leads to the end whereas the moment of importance is a perpetual flow in the world of the character. The third one is in fact closely bound with the second one, and it regards the social essence, impact or even social concern of epiphany, however, moment of importance is of individual (MA, 2011). This does not mean that epiphany is not individual, but rather the sudden realization is from the social to the individual that makes epiphany more panoramic. Besides, Joyce's epiphanies are not solely confined to the inner world of a character, but strongly affiliated with the character's social, religious or national affairs.

CHAPTER 3

JAMES JOYCE AND HIS USE OF EPIPHANY IN *DUBLINERS*

3. 1 Epiphany Disclosing the Condition of Modern Man in *Dubliners*

As a modernist writer James Joyce, who is experimental and innovative both on thematic and structural levels, mostly uses family, nationalism and religion issues in his works. Worthily his characters are real as in everyday life. Since the Roman Catholic Church is an important part of Irish people, infusing Irish society he shows prevalent effect of the Church in the public in his works.

From the fifteen short stories in *Dubliners* what can be found is the essence of the entire city of Dublin, where paralysis and stagnation are run rampant. Ordinary people in an ordinary city experience ordinary situations. However, these experiences are not ordinary for the people experiencing them rather these ordinary situations are touchstones for them. The reason why Joyce chooses Dublin as the setting can be explained by his own words:

My intention was to write a chapter of the moral history of my country and I chose Dublin for the scene because that city seemed to me the centre of paralysis. I have tried to present it to the indifferent public under four of its aspects: childhood, adolescence, maturity and public life. The stories are arranged in this order. I have written it for the most part in a style of scrupulous meanness and with the conviction that he is a very bold man who dares to alter in the presentment, still more to deform, whatever he has seen and heard (Stuart & Ellmann & Gilbert, 1966 p. 134).

Fagnoli and Gillespie mention that *Dubliners* “is a searing analysis of Irish middle- and lower-middle-class life, with Dublin not simply as its geographical setting but as the emotional and psychological locus as well” (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006, p. 45). James Joyce fills his childhood experiences into *Dubliners*. To him, Dublin is a place where spiritually paralyzing reality occurs. Chester suggests that

Joyce portrayed “epiphanized reality” “in ordinary Dublin life” (Chester, 1998, p. 6). Hence, the uniqueness of James Joyce’s *Dubliners* comes from ordinariness. As we have mentioned earlier, his first forty surviving epiphanies gives an impression of precept. However, the epiphanies that are used in *Dubliners* are quite vivid for the grounds that they are from everyday life, which makes his epiphanies very similar due to the fact that personal experience or realization comes from the ordinary life, making his characters alive let alone credible. In this respect, Joyce’s characters are panoramic.

Dubliners is divided into four parts as James Joyce himself stated: “childhood, adolescence, maturity and public life”. Although these phases follow each other, it is not the case for the geography of Dublin. As Bulson underlines the overlap of the movement of characters and the public places where characters call at such as church, shops, restaurants and pubs reflect the “moments of transition” of Dublin (Bulson, in Rabaté, 2004, p. 55). Thus, the transition of a city intermingles with the transition of moral and national issues.

While in some stories the transition of an issue of place prevalent, in some “twoness or doubling” is seen in *Dubliners*: “the doubles of the absent father, such as the two expected candles in *The Sisters*; the doubled characters of *Two Gallants* and *Counterparts*; the double meanings that pervade the whole ensemble” (Ellmann, 2010, p. 104).

As far as his characterization is concerned, his characters in *Dubliners* are kneaded not only with their intellectual aspects but also with their moral aspects. This means that his panoramic characters are not portrayed in unilateral. However, when it comes to the moment of revelation, the intellectual aspects of his characters come into prominence even though the origin of epiphanies has a divine aspect. With the intellectual completion the divinity aspect of his epiphanies becomes secular by the realization or the deep insight of characters. Through this realization or deep insight, the term whose origin lies beneath divinity turns into a secular term. It is

James Joyce, who transforms the term into “secular revelation of selfhood” (Hart, 2007, p. 345). As we have mentioned the characters in *Dubliners* are ordinary people who are forced to escape from triviality of their lives with the help of epiphanies. Their trivial, ordinary lives become momentous by epiphanic moments.

When his epiphanies in *Dubliners* are taken into consideration from the point of readers, it is evident that readers collaborate with the character during this special moment. Even in some stories, Joyce leaves reader alone in the epiphanic moment, which turns into the revelation of the reader. However, these integrated moments with the reader may result in a loose in gripping the reader. According to David Lodge, when the protagonist, reader or both realize(s) the “moment of truth” in *Dubliners*, it leads to an anti-climax (Lodge, 1992). Moreover, the use of epiphany weakens the dynamism of novels as Belge suggested (1994). To illustrate, in some stories in *Dubliners* we witness descent of some characters or values to the extent that the loss of dynamism equals to the stagnation of Dublin. However, the moments which result in loose in dynamism provides enlightenment for Joyce’s characters. That’s to say, when movements disappear, a revelation in intellectual or emotional aspect appears. On the other hand; epiphany is a structural device enabling to indicate climax and provides flashback to the past events, a device which helps integrate or complete the gaps (Palls, 1984). According to Friedrich “Joyce’s stories are symptomatic, and his “epiphanies” are therefore not so much manifestations of the spirit of re-demption in mundane and trivial situations as they are occasions for a momentary acknowledgement of the very pathos of mundaneness and triviality” (Friedrich, 1995, p. 421).

Regarding the titles of the *Dubliners*, Schneider suggests that Joyce uses short titles through which he expands his view of not wasting a single word to the titles and links Joyce’s usage to the “gnomon” used in *The Sisters* (Schneider, in Rejoycing, 1998).

These fifteen stories are mostly unhappy tales, where innocence is missing, faith is wearing thin, opportunities are missed, hypocrisies and paralysis are

common. Most of the stories begin or later plunge into darkness which descends onto Dublin's streets and his characters. Parrinder suggests that paralysis in *Dubliners* "Ibsen's diagnosis of social death or rigor mortis" (2005, p. 67). Hence characters in *Dubliners* are living dead. The first story starts with death as the theme the title of the last story is *The Dead* by why the full "circle of life" is completed (Minutiae, 2009). Whereas the child in *The Sisters* cannot comprehend the death, the protagonist in *The Dead* can fully understands what it is.

3.2 Practical Argumentation

3.2.1 Senses in *The Sisters*

The Sisters, which is revised by James Joyce before its publication, deals predominantly with childhood. As James Joyce himself states it fits the childhood phase. As regards the title, it refers to Father Flynn's two sisters Eliza and Nannie, who are presented as voiceless characters. Father Flynn, a sympathetic character, has been paralyzed and after a few months he dies. The story is told by a little boy, as a first person narration. With the opening few lines the inevitability of death is presented through the eyes of a little boy who cannot make some sense at first. By using a boy's viewpoint, James Joyce establishes an undistorted and innocent point of view. It gives us childlike perception of death. In fact the boy tries to understand the environment as if he were newly born. The boy tries to understand what death is from a naive point of view. The initial perception of the boy is through observation. The opening lines of the story provide us to realize the condition of the boy against death which he cannot grasp altogether.

HERE was no hope for him this time: it was the third stroke. Night after night I had passed the house (it was vacation time) and studied the lighted square of window: and night after night I had found it lighted in the same way, faintly and evenly. If he was dead, I thought, I would see the reflection of candles on the darkened blind for I knew that two candles must be set at the head of a corpse. He had often said to me: "I am not long for this world," and I had thought his words idle. Now I knew they were true. Every night as I gazed up at the window I said softly to myself the word paralysis. It had always sounded strangely in my ears, like the word *gnomon* in the Euclid and the word *simony* in the Catechism. But now it sounded to me like the name of some maleficent and sinful being. It filled me with fear, and yet I longed to be nearer to it and to look upon its deadly work (Joyce, 2011, p. 1).

In the very beginning "paralysis", "gnomon" and "simony" are given. The child's vocabulary is extended when compared to his peers and to achieve this it likely that they have been transferred from the priest. When the definitions are

concerned, gnomon is “an imperfect that is formed when a small parallelogram is removed from two sides of a larger parallelogram” and simony “is named after Simon Magus, who ignorantly offered the Apostle Peter for money for the gift of God.....Hence simony is the deliberate intention of buying or selling spiritual things for a temporal price” (Gifford, 1967, p. 30). According to Ellmann the use of gnomon and simony leads to “dynamics of loss and substitution” and concludes that as there is no father image it “functions as the gnomon or the missing corner that instigates the simoniac traffic in false father” (Ellmann, 2010 p. 109). According to Fagnoli & Gillespie, in the opening part James Joyce emphasizes the “physical, spiritual and religious decay” (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 1995 p. 48). In this respect, Karrer draws attention to a very gripping pivot by disclosing the hidden allusion of italic written words. In *The Sisters* “paralysis”, “simony” and “gnomon” are written in Italics. In *An Encounter* “The Union Jack”, “Pluck” and “The Halfpenny Marvel” are written in Italics. In the third one in *Araby* “The Abbot”, “The Devout Communicant” and “The Memoirs of Vidocq” are written in Italics. This shows the invisible cord between the stories, which establishes an ambiguity. This may be a reflection for life as far as its uncertainty is concerned.

In the story, from the very beginning a motionless state prevails, a state which has been caused by the paralysis. However, in this motionless state it seems that life as a dynamic process goes on. The characters in the story move forward to their destinies. In this respect, Torchiana draws attention to the destiny of the boy and his helplessness in his destiny.

For the boy’s aunt and the sisters Flynn between them in fact spin out the boy’s fate, almost unknown to him, in recounting or pointing to the priest’s passage from life to death. Fatal sisters all, the three prophetically utter the doom or slow paralysis to come for another Dublin youth of intelligence, sensitivity, and scrupulosity who will be a disappointed priest in another realm (Torchiana, 1987, p. 28).

As regards the stagnation it is possible to link this motionlessness to the city of Dublin. Different from other stories in the book, the epiphanic moment comes from the very beginning, which paralyzes the whole story. James Joyce employs senses to achieve a better comprehension of his characters. To illustrate, Nannie offers wine and after wine is tasted, it satisfies gustaoception. With “the heavy odor in the room”, the smell of flowers, it satisfies olfaception. Touching the ground it satisfies tactile and hearing stories and dialogues the last sense, signifies audibility (Valente, 1999). The employment of the senses is important since Joyce presents these senses paralysed in the stories. Concerning the little boy, the perception of death by him is conceived only by seeing, which signifies visibility. Although senses are frequently used, the fully comprehension of a truth comes from a visual sense for him.

Different from his other stories in *Dubliners* epiphanic moment in *The Sisters* seems like a collection of moments rather than just a moment. As Beck suggests “liberation comes clerical and social domination into intellectual detachment” (Beck, 1969 p. 117). Beck shows epiphany:

As the story ends with one of the sisters still talking, the reader should be able to hear as the boy would have been hearing her by that time. This is to realize that though her words are about the priest, Joyce’s story is of the boy at that point, silent and still but brimming with insight. Here an epiphany, as a total experience, shows its intellectual factor, when a few additional facts consolidate intimations toward which the receiver has been intuitively groping. The boy has heard and also overhears; being informed, he becomes self-taught (Beck, 1969, p. 47).

The paralysis in this story is not only confined to Father Flynn’s condition. Apart from motionless, it also suggests intangibility and obliteration of senses, especially audible, is prevalent. In many stories in *Dubliners* paralysis is pervasive through the senses. As regards the type of epiphany, it is private and the boy tries to comprehend what death is.

The story ends with the unfinished sentence belonging to Eliza as if the story is not finished. In this respect, Friedrich explains that “The Sisters” as the “thematic prologue or overture” for the other stories is like a concluding paragraph of *The Dead* (Friedrich, 1995, p. 421). The boy in *The Sisters* seems to be Gabriel in *The Dead*, which suggests the stories in the book are sequenced or transitive stories although they seem to be separated stories at first glance.

3.2.2 Escaping Ordinariness in *An Encounter*

In the second story which is about childhood James Joyce's little boy in the *The Sisters* seems to going to school now. The perceptions of the boy seem to have changed a lot. Although he is only receptive and refrains from speaking in *The Sisters*, he has conversations in *An Encounter*. The surrounding for the boy also changes from indoor to outdoor and he is on the way of being a self.

As James Joyce's main issues are religion, nationality, family and education, this story is not an exception. The story which is told by the student boy touches on the education system. The system is presented through the understanding of the boys who doubtlessly find it dull, so the narrator, Mahony, and Leo Dillion want to escape from the ordinariness of life and they three plan to go to the Pigeon House, "formerly a fort, now the Dublin electricity and power station, located on a breakwater that projects out into Dublin Bay as a continuation of the south bank of the Liffey" (Gifford, 1967 p. 36). As Leo Dillion fails to come the next day the narrator and Mahony meet. Upon passing the other side by ferry, the boy and Mahony change their minds as they are tired and it is getting late, for being late may unfold their secret.

While they have a rest in the field, they meet with a man whom they find strange. At first the fairly old man comes and talks about the weather, schooldays, poets and girls. Later on he leaves them and it can be understood that he exposes his penis to them. While he is away, Mahony says "he is a queer old josser" (Joyce, 2011, p. 18). In the story it cannot be understood whether he is homosexual or pedophile. However, before leaving them whereas he talks about girls, in the second time he talks about boys and whipping them. The second appearance of the old man reveals his real intention. Here Leonard suggests that the old man's desire is fed not from action but his fantasy, so Leonard resembles his sentences to a "verbal ejaculation" and suggests that he is satisfied more than the physical one (Leonard,

1993, p. 67). The boy seems to stand aghast or perplexed toward the newly encountered adult life as the boy in *The Sisters* toward death. As Beck states:

both these stories center more definitely in emotions conditioned by adolescence through projected toward growing relationships; *The Sisters* conversely, is not much saturated with the immediate mood of reminiscence as it is tinged with more deliberate evaluation, in a withdrawal from relationships, that by implication repudiates explicit commitment (Beck, 1969, p. 94).

The boys who get in this affair to stop the ordinariness of life want to go back or turn their daily routine. The routine now seem to be safer for them.

This encounter from which the title comes from leads to a revelation for the narrator, the boy. Revelation comes from this moment as he is active now by making fake names to trick the old man. After calling Mahony as Murphy, he feels a sudden revelation. The last two lines serve to be epiphany:

Murphy!

My voice had an accent of forced bravery in it and I was ashamed of my paltry stratagem. I had to call the name again before Mahony saw me and hallooed in answer. How my heart beat as he came running across the field to me! He ran as if to bring me aid. And I was penitent; for in my heart I had always despised him a little (Joyce, 2011, p. 19).

During his talk with the fairly old man he is exposed to his attention and the old man praises the boy, which possibly makes him feel superior to Mahony. However, with the intrigue that the boy invented, they cheat the old man. The point here is that Mahony remembers and behaves according to the boy's plan, so he comes as if he were his saviour. They escape from the intruder without being known by their real names. "liberation comes from staining of a sense for adventure into a real knowledge of honest comradeship," Beck States (Beck, 1969 p. 117).

In the story aspects of paralysis are frustration, isolation and failure to communicate, which lead to a private epiphany. The protagonist feels the inescapability. The epiphanic moment is blurred with the guilt, but at the same time the guilty feeling towards Mahony results in “sudden spiritual manifestation” in “a memorable phase of the mind” (Joyce, 1963, p. 211).

3.2.3 Eyes in *Araby*

The story much as the first two stories is written in first person narration and is told by a boy. It is an “introspective” story with “unnamed” narrator as in the case of the first two stories (Fargnoli & Gillespie, 1995). The story begins with a description of the street given by the boy. He uses the word “blind” two times in the first paragraph and in the next paragraph, he speaks of a dead priest, who reminds the dead, father Flynn in *The Sisters*. “Blind” is also used in the first paragraph of *The Sisters*. “Blind” also makes us have a parallelism with the paralysis. In *Araby*, the protagonist reads “The Abbot”, “The devout Communicant” and “The Memoirs of Vidocq”. When compared to the previous two stories we clearly see the intellectual development Joyce’s characters, for the boy in the *The Sisters*, in *An encounter* boys read Wild West and finally in *Araby* the boy reads books. This clearly shows the intellectual progress of his characters in the childhood phase.

When compared to the first two stories, doubtlessly the boy is older and is now interfering in love affairs. While in the first story the boy is only a listener, in the second one the boy has dialogues even at the end the story, he slips out of a situation. As far as the third story is considered, the boy is extroverted. He grows aware of a girl and puts efforts to be near to her. In a sense, in the childhood phase, Joyce’s character struggles for the first time.

In first story, the boy doesn’t talk about girls, in the second one he doesn’t, either, but he is exposed to the descriptions made by the old man. In the third one, *Araby* the boy goes aware of a girl. This time love as a theme sets itself into the centre. As Beck states, James Joyce chooses a universal theme and sets it as a universal story.

Araby is above all a love story, of instinctive-imaginative passion naively held, unavoidably lost, and recollected as ardor an disenchantment. It is everyman’s puberty rite, imperious desire blunting itself upon limitations, and fragmenting into an opposite despair (Beck, 1969, p. 97).

It is Mangan's sister, who makes his heart leap. Gifford denotes that Mangan's sister is an allusion to James Clarence Mangan an Irish poet and he unfolds that "Mangan's sister is contrasted with the romantic self-dedication of the speaker in one of Mangan's most popular poems, "Dark Rosaleen" (Gifford, 1967, pp. 38-39).

Every morning he waits for her with hope and when she gets out, he walks behind her, and he passes her in an effort to be noticed. He now develops an interest in her and finally he finds a chance to speak to her. He defines the importance as "at last she spoke to me" (Joyce, 2011, p. 22). His use of language indicates that he has made efforts though his efforts were limited in actions, but striving in the mind. Their first talk is about *Araby*, which is a bazaar. She expresses that she cannot go to the *Araby*. Although there is no implication that he has an intention to go there, now it is a duty for him since he realizes that she has set her mind on *Araby*. He promises her that he will bring something. This is the first contact of the boy with the girl in the dialogue form.

Waiting for his uncle to come, getting required money and going out to reach *Araby* before it is closed are all for a promise, which is the substratum in their relation. When he reaches the bazaar with the "magical name" it is about to close. The darkness of the most part of the hall sets a parallelism with the hope inside him as it is dim but not lost. However, soon he hears a voice that the light will be out. He finds himself in sheer darkness which symbolizes his hope that he has lost. With these sentences the epiphany emerges in his inner world:

Gazing up into the darkness I saw myself as a creature driven and derided by vanity; and my eyes burned with anguish and anger (Joyce, 2011, p. 26).

He realizes his position against external world and he deeply feels helplessness against the dynamism of life. His eyes establish a sharp contrast with his situation in darkness. His deep frustration leads to his revelation of the external and

his standing in this world. The protagonist feels nonfulfillment and frustration. With his private epiphany, he comprehends inevitability.

This is the last story of childhood in *Dubliners*. The three stories are written in first person point of view. James Joyce's aim in writing first person narration might be the reason that he exposes the naive nature of children. Another reason might be the fact that children see themselves in the centre of universe. We all experience it is not the case at all by seeing the harsh and reckless side of the external world. For this very reason James Joyce closes the childhood phase by letting his character witness the cruelty of the external world. It is likely that there is a linear movement from one story to another. With the next story James Joyce goes on with the third person narrator, emphasizing the condition of the human against external world.

3.2.4 Tears in *Eveline*

Stepping into the adolescence phase, James Joyce changes the first person narration into the third person narration and for the first time a female becomes the narrator. The story begins with Eveline's sitting by the window. This moment gives the transition from the first person to the third person narration. Her eyes escape from the window from now on the centre of "I" changes and the subject "I" is lost in the darkness of the street.

As in the *Araby*, this is a story centred onto a love affair. James Joyce unfolds the understanding or point of view between male and female. In this story we even know our protagonist Eveline, who gives name to the title. The abundance of a dusty atmosphere is impressive. From the very beginning the word "dust" is used three times in the story:

She sat at the window watching the evening invade the avenue. Her head was leaned against the window curtains and in her nostrils was the odour of dusty cretonne (Joyce, 2011, p. 27).

Home! She looked round the room, reviewing all its familiar objects which she had dusted once a week for so many years, wondering where on earth all the dust came from (Joyce, 2011, p. 28).

Her time was running out but she continued to sit by the window, leaning her head against the window curtain, inhaling the odour of dusty cretonne"(Joyce, 2011, p. 30).

As she has lost his mother, all the household chores are carried out by Eveline, who also works at stores. Along with these duties, the lack of communication with her father and change in his attitudes towards her expose that her life is burdened with hardships. Joyce here again draws a portrait of Dublin from a perspective that women are entrapped and they have almost no voice, but a deep desire to escape, to escape from everything. The dust is like a coverlet wrapped everywhere, every memory, it is too overwhelming and the only way is to escape.

But in her new home, in a distant unknown country, it would not be like that. Then she would be married—she, Eveline. People would treat her with respect then. She would not be treated as her mother had been. Even now, though she was over nineteen, she sometimes felt herself in danger of her father's violence. She knew it was that had given her the palpitations (Joyce, 2011, p. 28).

She thinks that going too far seems to rub down all the dust that embedded her life. She is desperate to find a solution that would save her from this stifling atmosphere. For her, Frank seems to be saviour. He wants to take Eveline to Buenos Ayres, and provide her a life that she is lacking.

She must escape! Frank would save her. He would give her life, perhaps love, too. But she wanted to live. Why should she be unhappy? She had a right to happiness. Frank would take her in his arms, fold her in his arms. He would save her. (Joyce, 2011, p. 31)

It is clear that the aim is to escape and Frank seems to be only a mediator. However, Frank's intentions are indefinite. The story does not provide us with a certainty about Frank's character. Is Frank a kind of person as his name suggests?

She was about to explore another life with Frank. Frank was very kind, manly, open-hearted. She was to go away with him by the night-boat to be his wife and to live with him in Buenos Ayres where he had a home waiting for her (Joyce, 2011, p. 29).

As Luft suggests, “the issue of how free Eveline is to leave home is a textual manoeuvre. Awareness of such manoeuvres draws the reader away from an immediate involvement in Eveline's dilemma” (Luft, 2009, p. 48). However, to the end of the story the Eveline's dilemma is inevitable. Her dilemma deepens by the remembrance of her mother through a street organ. According to Leonard this functions as follows:

Eveline's visceral recollection of her mother's functions as a sort of mental umbilical cord that brings her unexpected and unsettling nourishment from the unseen and barely suspected world beyond the normal masquerade of femininity (Leonard, 1993, p. 100).

“Black mass of boat” and the “long mournful whistle” conflict with her desire to escape from sacrificing herself. Is the sea water a foreshadowing for her unhappiness as heap of tears in the future as Elka suggests (Elka, 2012).

The nausea inside her is brought in through epiphany.

A bell clanged upon her heart. She felt him seize her hand:

"Come!"

All the seas of the world tumbled about her heart. He was drawing her into them: he would drown her. She gripped with both hands at the iron railing.

"Come!"

No! No! No! It was impossible. Her hands clutched the iron in frenzy. Amid the seas she sent a cry of anguish!

"Eveline! Evvy!"

He rushed beyond the barrier and called to her to follow. He was shouted at to go on but he still called to her. She set her white face to him, passive, like a helpless animal. Her eyes gave him no sign of love or farewell or recognition (Joyce, 2011, p 32).

Her epiphany intermingles with her physical and emotional paralysis, which prevents her from getting on the boat. The paralysis now captures her body after her thoughts. She cannot go, as she was struck. The motionlessness leads to her frustration. With her private epiphanic moment, she understands the inescapability. According to Khan epiphany in *Eveline* differs from other stories, as it does not hold “transformative” and “restorative potential” rather they are “inefficacious” or “catastrophic” (Khan, 2013). Although Eveline’s paralysis keeps her from setting out her long journey, it allows her the possibility to perform an inner journey, to herself. Moreover; when the ending of the story is compared to *Araby*, Beck indicates that Eveline shed tears, whereas the boy in *Araby* burdens his tears inside, and he links this fact to different reactions of male and female (Beck, 1969).

3.2.5 Triviality in *After the Race*

It is the second story about adolescence and is written in third person narration. Unlike the previous story *Eveline*, the protagonist of *After the Race* is now male again, called Jimmy Doyle. “He was about twenty-six years of age, with a soft, light brown moustache and rather innocent-looking grey eyes” (Joyce, 2011, p. 33).

Fagnoli and Gillespie put forth the importance of the shift of narrative as follows:

the narrative shifts its emphasis from the central issues that characterize the other pieces in the collection—alienation and frustration within the middle and lower-middle classes—to focus attention on the nouveaux riches (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006 p. 54).

This time the prevalent mood is nonchalance, starting with Jimmy Doyle’s father and span to every character: “His father, who had begun life as an advanced Nationalist, had modified his views early” (Joyce, 2011, p. 33). Through the story an international glance is provided as James Joyce uses French cars, German car, Belgian driver, Canadian birth Andre Riviee, Hungarian named Villiona, Englishman named Routh, American’s yacht. To the end of the story they drink Ireland, England, France, Hungary, the United States of America. His father’s changing views bear parallelism with many nationalities. Jimmy Doyle’s father, who once supported his education, now supports his dealings, which only base upon money and status. This shows his father’s ultimate change both in his thoughts and actions. Among these nations, Jimmy Doyle might represent Irish people. Through his character James Joyce represents identity problems Dubliners have.

According to Torchiana the race presented in the story represents the Battle of Castlebar, which is later called Races of Castlebar. Joyce uses irony which discloses itself at the end of the story. While Jimmy Doyle has a victory in the beginning, he is a loser at the end as the outcome of Racer of Castlebar, which is a defeat for French and Irish (Torchiana, 1987, pp. 80-81).

Jimmy Doyle is a well-educated young man, however, the education background he has conflicts with the triviality he is living through. "He had sent his son to England to be educated in a big Catholic college and had afterwards sent him to Dublin University to study law" (Joyce, 2011, p. 33). His trivial condition is a parallel to the triviality of the modern man. Khan depicts that there is a race much as the title suggests. The race is in the society to gain a footing or statue (Khan, 2013).

Through the story, it is evident how people are estranged from each other and although they seem to be close.

Jimmy and his Hungarian friend sat behind. Decidedly Villona was in excellent spirits; he kept up a deep bass hum of melody for miles of the road. The Frenchmen flung their laughter and light words over their shoulders and often Jimmy had to strain forward to catch the quick phrase. This was not altogether pleasant for him, as he had nearly always to make a deft guess at the meaning and shout back a suitable answer in the face of a high wind. Besides Villona's humming would confuse anybody; the noise of the car, too (Joyce, 2011, pp. 34-35).

The main concern is the alienation and loneliness the modern man lives through. Man is so entrapped with the triviality of the day that, he cannot realize his condition.

Jimmy made a speech, a long speech, Villona saying: "Hear! hear!" whenever there was a pause. There was a great clapping of hands when he sat down. It must have been a good speech (Joyce, 2011, p. 39).

What Jimmy cares is to be there physically, but why and what for are not his concerns. He cannot judge even his own speech; he is dependent on the comments or the approval of others whom he thinks important for him.

To the end of the story, Jimmy and his friends go to the Belle of Newport, which is “an allusion to the early twentieth-century reputation of Newport as the ultimate in the lavish and mindless display of new wealth” (Gifford, 1967, p. 45).

Unlike the other stories we have dealt before, Joyce uses epiphany in this story by using time itself, so the importance of the moment is realized by the moment as universal. The last lines of the story unfold the time delusion Jimmy is in:

He knew that he would regret in the morning but at present he was glad of the rest, glad of the dark stupor that would cover up his folly. He leaned his elbows on the table and rested his head between his hands, counting the beats of his temples. The cabin door opened and he saw the Hungarian standing in a shaft of grey light:

"Daybreak, gentlemen!" (Joyce, 2011, p. 39).

James Joyce's epiphanies are for everybody, making a sudden realization of a truth. In *After The Race* we have a portrait of an afflicted person with class distinction and a wannabe. Triviality, alienation and powerlessness are their common characteristics. Again Joyce brings forward nationality affair. It is also a portrait of a group of people losing their memories.

3.2.6 Slavey in *Two Gallants*

Two Gallants is the third story in adolescence phase in which James Joyce uses third person narration. James Joyce himself stated that *Two Gallants* was his one of the favourite stories. It was not in the first twelve stories, he added it later. Although his publisher wanted him to omit *Two Gallants* he resisted at the risk of ruining publication of the book, stating following:

I have agreed to omit the troublesome word (bloody) in *Two Gallants*. To omit the story from the book would really be disastrous. It is one of the most important stories in the book. I would rather sacrifice five of the (which I could name) than this one. It is the story after (*Ivy Day in the Committee Room*) which pleases me most. I have shown you that I can concede something to your fears. But you cannot really expect me to mutilate my work (Stuart & Ellmann & Gilbert 1966, p87-88).

The story, like many stories in the book, takes place in the dark, from evening to night. As in the other stories, the characters are left in the darkness. As far as its characters are concerned, they are ordinary Dubliners. However, this time the triviality of the characters are unrivalled when compared to the six stories we have examined so far. To start with the title, it is an irony when the main characters are taken into consideration, as Lenehan and Corley are stuck into narrowness not only in vicinity but also in their thoughts. Lenehan admires Corley for his craft in chatting up with girls, so in the story Corley is dominant. As Leonard suggest “Corley moves from being Lenehan’s puppet to becoming his messiah” (Leonard 1993, p. 125).

According to Fagnoli and Gillespie from the very beginning of the story the themes reveal:

In its opening lines, *Two Gallants* first foregrounds images of smug materiality, and then quickly undercuts them with descriptions introducing the themes of futility, insensitivity, hypocrisy, and bitterness that emerge over the course of the narrative (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006, p. 56).

Apart from these themes, one of the main themes in the story is betrayal, as Litz suggests. When James Joyce leaves Dublin, he has a feeling of “betrayed by many of his contemporaries”, but his staying in Pola and Trieste aggravates this feeling let alone alleviate, so while writing this story, the feeling of betrayed is dominant (Litz, 1996). The betrayal begins with the title, as Corley pretends to be polite although he is not. It seems that James Joyce’s selection of the title and the inner world of the characters exhibit his frustration. Ellmann denotes that James Joyce’s stories mostly represent “distinction between victim and victimizer” and names the slavey as an “obvious victim” and concludes that “in Dublin the exploited exploit each other in a world reduced to debt and doubt” (Ellmann, 2010, p. 112). Victims and victimizer are intertwined in *Dubliners* as a victimizer is a victim in other standpoint. Although the young slavey in *Two Gallants* seems to exploit Corley, she is at the same time exploited by him. James Joyce again uses universal themes and his ordinary Dubliners to burden universal issues.

Corley meets with young slavey, but Lenehan wants to see their meeting. Now, Lenehan is alone. Lenehan is such a lonely man that he simply does not have any opinion how to wait for him: “The problem of how he could pass the hours till he met Corley again troubled him a little. He could think of no way of passing them but to keep on walking” (Joyce, 2011, p. 47). He is deep in loneliness, but his concern is to be or at least pretend to be in upper-class member, so the frustration goes deep inside him. To illustrate while waiting for Corley, Lenehan drops in a Refreshment Bar to eat.

He paused at last before the window of a poor-looking shop over which the words Refreshment Bar were printed in white letters. He eyed this food earnestly for some time and then, after glancing warily up and down the street, went into the shop quickly (Joyce, 2011, p. 47).

He tries not to be seen by anybody though people know him should know the truth which he ignores. After he satisfies his hunger at the Refreshment Bar some

questions have arisen in his mind that may lead some a kind of illumination about his life:

This vision made him feel keenly his own poverty of purse and spirit. He was tired of knocking about, of pulling the devil by the tail, of shifts and intrigues. He would be thirty-one in November. Would he never get a good job? Would he never have a home of his own? He thought how pleasant it would be to have a warm fire to sit by and a good dinner to sit down to. He had walked the streets long enough with friends and with girls. He knew what those friends were worth: he knew the girls too. Experience had embittered his heart against the world (Joyce, 2011, p. 48).

In deep he is asking for a decent life; a life different from the one he has had so far. By starting questioning, a kind of trial of illumination starts:

But all hope had not left him. He felt better after having eaten than he had felt before, less weary of his life, less vanquished in spirit. He might yet be able to settle down in some snug corner and live happily if he could only come across some good simple-minded girl with a little of the ready (Joyce, 2011, p. 49).

After having his dinner, he runs into his two friends, who ask trivial questions. The conversation between them is restricted to these questions and the triviality is prevailing.

Finally Corley appears just after Lenehan's mind is looking for answers for the matters about Corley. He is obsessed with Corley and he thinks as if he were Corley. Lenehan watches Corley and slavey's coming. He realizes that after the slavey gets into the house a woman goes out and again gets in. When he meets with Corley, he doesn't answer, they walk, but he doesn't answer to his questions. However, when it is far enough from the slavey's house, he answers, which is an epiphanic moment:

Corley halted at the first lamp and stared grimly before him. Then with a grave gesture he extended a hand towards the light and, smiling, opened it

slowly to the gaze of his disciple. A small gold coin shone in the palm (Joyce, 2011, p. 51).

The epiphanic moment signifies the loss of human values which result from betrayal, triviality, failure to establish relationships, moral values and alienation. “A small gold coin” which he keeps in his palm is a symbolic tie between them as it shows that everything is okay. However, we obviously witness the loss of human values. Although the reader is driven as “two gallants” are focused on the relation between the slavey and Corley, it emerges that their main focus is to benefit from the slavey. Bulson draws attention to the circle of the coin:

the coin is also a circle that many readers have seen as a symbol of Irish paralysis and self-betrayal. “Two Gallants” is a story filled with such circles. The solitary Lenehan walks in circles around Dublin (Bulson, in Rabaté 2006 p. 43-44).

Bulson also concludes that it is impossible to get out of these circles (in Rabaté, 2006). The characters Joyce portraits are not only confined to Dublin, but also they are confined to their triviality and their alienation.

3.2.7 *The Boarding House: A Cleaver Splitting The Soul*

The Boarding House, the last story about the adolescence, is narrated in the third person. Female characters, Polly and her mother Mrs. Mooney, prevail in the story and as in *Eveline* the theme is love and relation. Whereas *Eveline* seems to be cast away and is somehow alone, Polly is led by her mother, who spins her future. Besides while *Eveline* is with her father, Polly is with her mother, Mrs. Mooney. James Joyce here portrays and in a sense compares the roles of men and women. While *Eveline* seems to be lost, Mrs. Mooney determines her daughter's future. Unlike *Eveline*, Polly's mother predestines her future.

From the very beginning Mrs. Mooney, the daughter of a butcher, is portrayed as a strong, determined and persevering woman. She was married to her father's foreman, who changes a lot after his father death she now lives with her daughter and her son, Jack. Mrs. Mooney is a looser in her marriage. After separation she sets a boarding house in Hardwicke Street to make a living. She is good at running the boarding house. "She governed her house cunningly and firmly, knew when to give credit, when to be stern and when to let things pass" (Joyce, 2011, p. 53). The residents call her *The Madam*. However, the word also means: "slang for the proprietress of a house of prostitution" (Gifford, 1967, p. 48). James Joyce might foreshadow a love affair that will take place in the boarding house. Upon her father's constant visit to the office where Polly works, Mrs. Mooney gets her daughter into her boarding house where many young men stay. Leonard defines Mrs. Mooney's boarding house as follows: "Mrs. Mooney's boarding house can be seen as a universe of representation within the symbolic order- a universe as necessary as it is distorted" (Leonard, 1993, p. 136).

As Polly was very lively the intention was to give her the run of the young men. Besides, young men like to feel that there is a young woman not very far away (Joyce, 2011, p. 54).

Mrs. Mooney realizes that Polly flirts with men, but she keeps silent although at first she thinks of sending her back to the office, where she was working. Polly has a love affair with Doran, who has a decent job, yet while he is in his thirty-five, Polly is only nineteen years old. To compare their educational background, Doran is much more educated than Polly. On the other hand, the contrast might be the sparkling for their affair; Polly with poor grammar and Doran with lack of affection. Even so, it can be still concluded that Doran does not seem to be the suitor for Polly. However, Mrs. Mooney should find him suitable, therefore she keeps silent.

At last, when she judged it to be the right moment, Mrs. Mooney intervened. She dealt with moral problems as a cleaver deals with meat: and in this case she had made up her mind (Joyce, 2011, p. 54).

Mrs. Mooney takes their affair as a spiritless or emotionless as she resembles the affair to meat. Her dealing with the affair as a butcher deals with meat using cleaver. From Joyce's use of cleaver, the problem is clearly exposed there is no soul; a city that has lost its soul.

The question was: What reparation would he make? There must be reparation made in such cases. It is all very well for the man: he can go his ways as if nothing had happened, having had his moment of pleasure, but the girl has to bear the brunt. Some mothers would be content to patch up such an affair for a sum of money; she had known cases of it. But she would not do so. For her only one reparation could make up for the loss of her daughter's honour: marriage (Joyce, 2011, pp. 55-56).

As feelings have turned into a lifeless meat, cleaver is now at work. Reparation and cleaver with its keen sharpness effectuate a contrast much as the contrast between Doran and Polly. Before Mrs. Mooney sets off her plan "She counted all her cards again before sending Mary up to Mr. Doran's room to say that she wished to speak with him" (Joyce, 2011, p. 56). Mrs. Mooney shows consistency in her behaviours still she approaches the affair as a business affair.

On a Sunday, Mrs. Mooney takes the action and sends Polly upstairs. Beck introduces Polly: “She is a living example that hypocrisy is not always the simple thing melodrama makes of it, but sometimes deeper and insidiously harder to cope” (Beck, 1969, p. 153). After Joyce exposes Mrs. Mooney stream of conscious, he now presents Doran’s:

The harm was done. What could he do now but marry her or run away? He could not brazen it out. The affair would be sure to be talked of and his employer would be certain to hear of it. Dublin is such a small city: everyone knows everyone else’s business (Joyce, 2011, p. 56).

Now, Mr. Doran feels himself stuck into the reality. As he doesn’t want to ruin his business in this small city, Dublin, he, with the cry of Polly, leads to his reparation. Mrs. Mooney dissects her daughter’s future in the same manner she deals with business. Now, Mr. Doran with his dimmed glasses with moisture goes downstairs to speak to Mrs. Mooney. His dimmed glasses symbolize the blurred reality that he cannot see. As if there were a curtain, he cannot see the truth. Mr. Doran stands for Dubliners, who have lost the truth and reality and who cannot escape. Because of the pressure of Dubliners, Polly and Doran get married.

While Doran is going down, he has a revelation; understanding of a truth: the entrapment by Mrs. Mooney. As for the epiphanic moment Polly lives through is:

At last she heard her mother calling. She started to her feet and ran to the banisters.
 "Polly! Polly!"
 "Yes, mamma?"
 "Come down, dear. Mr. Doran wants to speak to you."
 Then she remembered what she had been waiting for (Joyce, 2011, p. 59).

As Doran is not here to stay for Polly, she even forgets the importance of the moment. Mr. Doran’s epiphany is his realization of his entrapment in the conventions of the society. When Mr. Doran and Polly realize their situation, it is

too late to get out of the swirl of moral issues. Mr. Doran is entrapped in the values of society. Mr. Doran's dimmed glasses render as a paralysis of visible, which hinders him to see the consequences. As a result Mr. Doran has a revelation of the situation that is not possible to step back. Fagnoli and Gillespie stress that the moral context shows up like a character in the story:

Joyce's story carefully avoids the clichéd, melodramatic view of lower-middle-class seduction. Instead, it highlights not the behavior of individuals but the moral context of that behavior—the most active and powerful “character” in the story (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 1995 p. 59).

Moral context is much more prevalent than the struggle of an individual. Individual cannot hinder himself/herself to be in the swirl of moral sentiment of the society. With *The Boarding House*, reader has an understanding of the code of people who live in Dublin. How self-betrayal characters inside show off himself/herself as a moral character and how moral judgement works are presented in the story.

3.2.8 *A Little Cloud: Tears from a Cloud*

A Little Cloud is the first story on maturity. It is narrated in third person. In this story, James Joyce's protagonist is Little Chandler, who especially questions his decisions on his choosing his wife when he is thirty-two. James Joyce makes his protagonist question his life with Ignatius Gallaher's reappearing, who has left Dublin's cycle.

As far as the title of the story is concerned Fagnoli and Gilliespie suggest that the title of the story comes from biblical verse 1 Kings 18.44:

And it came to pass at the seventh time, that he said, Behold, there ariseth a little cloud out of the sea, like a man's hand." The passage punctuates an account of the defeat of the prophets of Baal by God's prophet Elijah. By ending a long drought that had plagued the people of Israel, Elijah manifested to them the power of God, and brought the people of Ahab back to the worship of the Lord. The line from which Joyce draws his title marks the turning point in Elijah's struggle to overcome the prophets of Baal. Joyce depicts a similar contest, arguably based on this struggle, in his account of the confrontation of St. Patrick and the Druid in *Finnegans Wake* (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006 p. 60).

It has been eight years since Little Chandler and Gallaher met each other. When Gallaher pays a visit to his motherland, Dublin, he meets Little Chandler, who is entrapped in Dublin. After they meet, start talking and drinking. Little Chandler ask questions to justify his thoughts that anywhere out of Dublin is immoral.

Tell me," he said, "is it true that Paris is so... immoral as they say?"
Ignatius Gallaher made a catholic gesture with his right arm.

"Every place is immoral," he said. "Of course you do find spicy bits in Paris. Go to one of the students' balls, for instance. That's lively, if you like, when the cocottes begin to let themselves loose. You know what they are, I suppose?"

.....

"Ah," he said, "you may say what you like. There's no woman like the Parisienne—for style, for go

"Then it is an immoral city," said Little Chandler, with timid insistence—"I mean, compared with London or Dublin?" (Joyce, 2011, p. 67).

As Little Chandler is trapped in Dublin, he wonders about the outside of his circle, yet in order to comfort himself, he is obsessed with the belief that the other places are immoral. Although Little Chandler is very inquisitive about lands where he has never been to, he is stuck in this cycle. Through the end of their conversation, Little Chandler invites Gallaher to their house, yet Gallaher does not accept it, so Little Chandler returns to his routine alone.

After their meeting ends, the settings changes to Little Chandler and his wife Annie's house. Little Chandler's has an educational background when compared to Annie. He is fond of poetry and he hesitates to share it with his wife:

He remembered the books of poetry upon his shelves at home. He had bought them in his bachelor days and many an evening, as he sat in the little room off the hall, he had been tempted to take one down from the bookshelf and read out something to his wife. But shyness had always held him back; and so the books had remained on their shelves. At times he repeated lines to himself and this consoled him (Joyce, 2011, p. 61).

This shows the paralysis of voice as he never reads poems aloud. When his wife goes to buy some tea, he is alone with his son, who is sleeping. While holding the baby, Little Chandler's eyes catches Annie's photo:

A little lamp with a white china shade stood upon the table and its light fell over a photograph which was enclosed in a frame of crumpled horn. It was Annie's photograph (Joyce, 2011, p. 72).

His looking at the photograph engenders a free association and by means of this, we witness stream of consciousness of Little Candler's thoughts on his decisions about marriage:

Those dark Oriental eyes, he thought, how full they are of passion, of voluptuous longing!... Why had he married the eyes in the photograph? He caught himself up at the question and glanced nervously round the room. He found something mean in the pretty furniture which he had bought for his house on the hire system. Annie had chosen it herself and it reminded him of her. It too was prim and pretty. A dull resentment against his life awoke within him. Could he not escape from his little house? Was it too late for him to try to live bravely like Gallaher? Could he go to London? There was the furniture still to be paid for. If he could only write a book and get it published, that might open the way for him (Joyce, 2011, p. 73).

He regrets his choice marrying Annie, and he aspires that the life Gallaher has. He is allured with the notion of escaping. The characters in *Dubliners* mostly want to escape from the situation they are having. Unlike other characters, Little Chandler is profound. He starts reading a poem by Byron, however, he turns back to reality by his son's crying.

It was useless. He couldn't read. He couldn't do anything. The wailing of the child pierced the drum of his ear. It was useless, useless! He was a prisoner for life (Joyce, 2011, p. 74).

His desire to go back to imagery and his son's reminding him the truth, Little Chandler lives a kind of nervous breakdown and shouts at his baby, which worsens the situation. Meanwhile his wife, Annie comes and she starts blaming Little Chandler.

Little Chandler felt his cheeks suffused with shame and he stood back out of the lamplight. He listened while the paroxysm of the child's sobbing grew less and less; and tears of remorse started to his eyes (Joyce, 2011, p. 75).

As for epiphanic moment, Little Chandler's realization of the fact that he cannot change his life results in private epiphany. He wants but he cannot speak, which signifies paralysis of voice. The tears coming from his eyes are the solid and bitter evidence of his understanding of a truth which cannot be changed. Fagnoli and Gillespie explain the last line:

This last line of the story cannot redeem the harsh critique of bourgeois Irish domestic attitudes so carefully built up over the course of the narrative, nor is it meant to. Nonetheless, it underscores for readers the complexity and even the contradictory nature of Chandler's attitudes. If he inhabits a sort of domestic hell antithetical to a supposedly carefree life like the one that Gallaher lives, it is one that Chandler has carefully constructed and conscientiously maintains for himself (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006 p. 60).

This story seems to be a continuation of *The Boarding House* as Polly and Doran decide to get married because of the conventions of the people living there. The oppression which leads them to get married might result in an unhappy marriage, much as Annie and Little Chandler. With his repressed feelings as a little cloud, Little Chandler shed tears as a cloud pours rain. This time James Joyce makes his male character cry in the maturity phase while he doesn't make his male characters cry in childhood and adolescence.

3.2.9 *Counterparts*: A victim finds another victim

The second story in maturity, *Counterparts* is narrated in third person narration. The protagonist of this story is Farrington, who isn't even called Mr. at workplace where he works as a clerk copier. He has some problems with his chief, Mr. Alleyne. Farrington is a lower middle class man, whom we observe him at work place, in pubs and finally at home. What we, as the readers feel, is his failure not only at work but also in social and family life. That day he has some problems with his chief/supervisor about a non-copied contract and afterwards about lost letters. When Mr. Alleyne wants him to finish it, Farrington gets stress-filled and he goes to drink beer instead of finishing it. In *Dubliners*, characters whether explicitly or implicitly want to escape from their lives. *Counterparts* is not an exception. Upon returning from drinking beer, he has an argument with Mr. Alleyne:

"do you take me for a fool? Do you think me an utter fool?"

The man glanced from the lady's face to the little egg-shaped head and back again; and, almost before he was aware of it, his tongue had found a felicitous moment:

"I don't think, sir," he said, "that that's a fair question to put to me" (Joyce, 2011, p. 81).

Although he deliberately puts his words and most probably he believes it, he steps back and apologizes for the fear of losing his job. This is the first repression for him we witness. Mr. Alleyne, who most probably represents Dublin masculinity, does not allow him talk, which makes Farrington an intimidated worker and subject.

With the last moments in the workplace, James Joyce again uses darkness. The darkness in *Dubliners* represents the hopelessness. After his workplace, we witness Farrington's social life. He pawns his watch in Terry Kelly's pawn-office to find money for the purpose of having some drink. He desperately thinks that drinking is a way to forget all his abasement at work. He wanders some pubs with his friends

as if he were looking for something; however, whatever he does even ridiculing what he said to Mr. Alleyne doesn't help. He wanders pubs with his friends and his desire to forget is not fulfilled. Farrington loses arm-wrestling to his friend Weathers, whom he considers to be a "mere boy". His social life is not different from his work life, he is frustrated again.

Before he goes home we witness an epiphanic moment for Farrington while he is waiting for the tram:

A very sullen-faced man stood at the corner of O'Connell Bridge waiting for the little Sandymount tram to take him home. He was full of smouldering anger and revengefulness. He felt humiliated and discontented; he did not even feel drunk; and he had only twopence in his pocket. He cursed everything. He had done for himself in the office, pawned his watch, spent all his money; and he had not even got drunk. He began to feel thirsty again and he longed to be back again in the hot reeking public-house. He had lost his reputation as a strong man, having been defeated twice by a mere boy. His heart swelled with fury and, when he thought of the woman in the big hat who had brushed against him and said Pardon! his fury nearly choked him (Joyce, 2011, p. 86).

He deeply realizes the frustration he has now. A problematic work, trivial friends and not even trying to change something in his life, all result in a frustration which captures his altogether. His revelation is accepting the truth about his life, yet he lacks the ambition of doing something in order to change it.

Finally, when he arrives home, Tom, one of his five children, meets him. Tom, as if he were a parent, carries out many responsibilities that should not be his part. In this respect, Beck touches on the reversal of duties:

There is also a reversal of roles in another way, in that this irresponsible man who has behaved so childishly is now to be cared for by the responsible child, who answers his call, tells where the mother is, lights the lamp, and is going to cook his father's dinner (Beck, 1969, p. 197).

Although Tom carries out the responsibilities which are not his own, he is beaten by his father, a fact which reveals Farrington's failure and frustration at home. His life is full of frustration, which is caused by oppression. His oppressed feelings in his battered soul are directed to his son by beating him. His frustration results in son's victimization. He has no voice for Mr. Alleyne and Weathers, still his son is his cup of tea.

James Joyce with this story shows how the oppression in social life results in private life. Farrington is oppressed in his social life, yet he tries to escape from his repressed state by directing his harshness to his son. To emphasize this, James Joyce sweeps the roles of father and son. Fagnoli and Gillespie assume that Tom and his father are the counterparts of the story, which the title suggests and they signify the cruelty of life (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006). James Joyce represents the chain of victims; a victim finds another victim for abuse. Whereas Farrington is a victim for Mr. Alleyne, Tom is a victim for Farrington.

3.2.10 Touching the Death in *Clay*

Clay is the third story about maturity and it is a third-person narration story. The protagonist is elderly a maid, Maria. The opening lines direct us to a workplace as the opening lines of *Counterparts*. Unlike Farrington, at the outset we have a good impression of the character and Maria is a hardworking and beloved maid, which shows a contrast with *Counterparts*. Apart from Maria's being industrious, she is seen as "a veritable peace-maker".

Maria was a very, very small person indeed but she had a very long nose and a very long chin. She talked a little through her nose, always soothingly: "Yes, my dear," and "No, my dear (Joyce, 2011, p. 89).

From the very beginning there is an impression that she is happy in her work life, besides it is disclosed during the tea party that she is not married. Beck defines Maria as: "is the pathos of a blameless human inadequacy to surmount natural limitation" (Beck, 1969, p. 201).

As in *Counterparts* the story sets out towards evening. However, the story continues the next morning. Joyce rarely uses morning as the setting in his stories. In the morning, Maria goes out when streets are shining with rain. It is worth to emphasize the importance day time. When compared many of the stories in *Dubliners*, the daylight might suggest a hope as many entrapped characters are in the darkness at least until she signs, in other words until she has a revelation.

When Maria is on the way to her friends, Donnellys, she decides to buy a cake, but a special cake:

She decided to buy some plumcake but Downes's plumcake had not enough almond icing on top of it so she went over to a shop in Henry Street. Here she was a long time in suiting herself and the stylish young lady behind the counter, who was evidently a little annoyed by her, asked her was it wedding-

cake she wanted to buy. That made Maria blush and smile at the young lady; but the young lady took it all very seriously and finally cut a thick slice of plumcake, parcelled it up (Joyce, 2011, p. 92).

Walzl mentions the tradition of Irish to bake wedding cakes with fruit and suggests that it is a wedding cake (Walzl, 1971). However, when she arrives Donnelly's house, she cannot find the plumcake that she has bought and it remains as a mystery.

They begin to play a game, in which they try to find out the objects by only touching:

she put her hand out in the air as she was told to do. She moved her hand about here and there in the air and descended on one of the saucers. She felt a soft wet substance with her fingers and was surprised that nobody spoke or took off her bandage. There was a pause for a few seconds; and then a great deal of scuffling and whispering. Somebody said something about the garden, and at last Mrs. Donnelly said something very cross to one of the next-door girls and told her to throw it out at once: that was no play. Maria understood that it was wrong that time and so she had to do it over again: and this time she got the prayer-book (Joyce, 2011, p. 95).

Maria touches clay which results in a silence in the house and later on people in the house start whispering later. Fluet clarifies the situation as: "according to the rules, her unintentional selection foretells her death in a year's time" (Fluet, 2011 p. 194). Her contact with clay is foreshadowing for death.

Within this narrow cell reclines her clay,
That clay where once... (Joyce, 2011, p. 74).

These verses are taken from Lord Byron's poem *On The Death of A Young Lady Cousin to the Author, and very dear to him*. James Joyce reinforces the meaning of clay as reminiscence for death. Whereas "ring" is an object implying marriage at the tea party, now clay is an object implying death. On the other side when Marry touches the clay, she cannot realize it, which signifies the paralysis of tactile. Upon Maria's selecting clay, Joe asks and Mrs. Donnelly insists Maria to sing. She sings "I Dreamt that I Dwelt", however she makes a mistake and when she is to sing the second verse, she sings the first verse again. Nobody intends to voice her mistake. Is

it a mistake or an epiphanic moment for Maria? In order to find out, it is better to take the missed verses into consideration:

I dreamt that suitors sought my hand;
That knights upon bended knee,
And with vows no maiden heart could withstand
They pledg'd their faith to me;
And I dreamt that one of that noble host
Came forth my hand to claim.
But I also dreamt, which pleased me most,
That you lov'd me still the same (Gifford, 1967, p. 54)

Plumcake which symbolizes marriage is lost, so suitors in the song do not reflect Maria's situation, for this reason she might deliberately make a mistake and sings the first verse again. The realization of her situation makes a revelation. Upon losing plumcake and choosing clay she is now hopeless. The epiphanic moment is her comprehension of reality with its blatantly obviousness. Her private epiphanic moment is her realization of her lack of love.

3.2.11 *A Painful Case*: “We are Our Own”

A Painful Case is the last story on maturity written in third person narration. When it was written in 1905 its name was different: “A Painful Incident”. It was later altered by James Joyce himself. The story has been inspired a real experience from James Joyce’s brother, Stanislaus Joyce (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006, pp. 65-66).

Mr. James Duffy is a cashier of a private bank in Beggot Street. From the beginning, it is obvious that he is in a total loneliness and he is isolated from the rest of the world.

He had neither companions nor friends, church nor creed. He lived his spiritual life without any communion with others, visiting his relatives at Christmas and escorting them to the cemetery when they died (Joyce, 2011, p. 99).

His daily life is like a circle beginning at work place later on his lunch, dinner and he is finally at home. He does not interfere with anything until he meets a woman and her daughter by “an invitation to talk” in Rotunda, “a building on Rutland Square which contained a theatre, concert hall, and assembly rooms” (Gifford, 1967, p. 56). Upon lady’s eagerness of a dialogue, now she is a subject for his memory as he tries to “fix her permanently in his memory”.

The eyes were very dark blue and steady. Their gaze began with a defiant note but was confused by what seemed a deliberate swoon of the pupil into the iris, revealing for an instant a temperament of great sensibility. The pupil reasserted itself quickly, this half-disclosed nature fell again under the reign of prudence.... (Joyce, 2011, p. 99)

Mr. Duffy is now attached to Mrs. Sinico’s eyes. Giles explains the first impression as follows:

Joyce gives Mrs. Sinico’s eyes a life of their own, and they seem to acquire a character all the more compelling because of their defiance. To gain speed, he changes “In an moment” to “for and instant” and adds “quickly”. Joyce

foregrounds the notion of defiance. While “extreme” seems to promote a subtle hysteria about Mrs. Sinico, “great” seems noble, and a similar dignity governs the substitution of “reign” for “control”. And the substitution of “her astrakhan jacket” for “the astrakhan jacket” brings the reader’s attention away from her eyes and back to the person of Mrs. Sinico and her coming defiance of socio-sexual norms hiding even then in her bosom (Giles, in Power, 1997, p. 199).

Upon meeting her for the third time “by mistake” he demands a rendezvous. Mrs. Sinico is married to a captain, who “had dismissed his wife so sincerely from his gallery of pleasures that he did not suspect that anyone else would take an interest in her” (Joyce, 2011, p. 100). Moreover, as Captain Sinico thinks Mr. Duffy as a suitor for his daughter, he promotes their meetings.

Mr. Duffy, as an intellectual character, shares his fund of knowledge with her when they meet. In this respect, of all the characters we have examined so far it can be concluded that he is the closest character to Little Chandler when their intellectual level is taken into consideration. Both Mr. Duffy and Little Chandler are fond of romantic poets. While Little Chandler reads a poem by Lord Byron, Mr. Duffy has a book of William Wordsworth. Joyce also shows a parallelism between Wordsworth and Mr. Duffy as they have long walks.

While Mr. Duffy is with Mrs. Sinico, he discloses that he once attended even assisted the gatherings of Irish Socialist Party, which “was a small series of study groups, vaguely committed to every improvement in the mode of life, but with little or no political power or presence” (Gifford, 1967, p. 56). We have now an impression that Mr. Duffy’s utter loneliness was not the case years ago. His loneliness seems to be a chosen loneliness rather than a fate. And he continues by stating “No social revolution, he told her, would be likely to strike Dublin for some centuries” (Joyce, 2011, p. 101). As an intellectual character and with a socialist background he is well aware of the fact that the paralysis striking any individual in Dublin. Thus, it can be suggested that after struggling for a while, he has stopped struggling for a group, but is he struggling for an individual?

With their ongoing meetings, they get closer not only mentally but also physically.

“Often they spent their evenings alone. Little by little, as their thoughts entangled, they spoke of subjects less remote. Her companionship was like a warm soil about an exotic. Many times she allowed the dark to fall upon them, refraining from lighting the lamp. The dark discreet room, their isolation, the music that still vibrated in their ears united them. This union exalted him, wore away the rough edges of his character, emotionalised his mental life” (Joyce, 2011, p. 101).

Mr. Duffy feels himself uncomfortable because their relation starts to change in a way that he does not approve. He lives a revelation not only about their relation but also a revelation about inescapable loneliness:

Sometimes he caught himself listening to the sound of his own voice. He thought that in her eyes he would ascend to an angelical stature; and, as he attached the fervent nature of his companion more and more closely to him, he heard the strange impersonal voice which he recognised as his own, insisting on the soul's incurable loneliness. We cannot give ourselves, it said: we are our own (Joyce, 2011, p. 101).

Unlike other characters in *Dubliners*, Mr. Duffy is aware of his existence. In his room on the shelf are there Friedrich Nietzsche's books *Thus Spake Zarathustra* and *The Gay Science*, which express his pessimism and losing his hope to escape. After a short break for their relation, he asks her the next rendezvous to be in a cakeshop, but despite the cold weather they walk for hours and they decide to cease their relation. The cold air reflects their relation which leads to a frozen one.

It has been four years since their break-up, yet he feels in his any and every inch of being. While he is avoiding seeing Mrs. Sinico, he expresses an understanding on relations: “Love between man and man is impossible because there must not be sexual intercourse and friendship between man and woman is impossible because there must be sexual intercourse” (Joyce, 2011, p. 102). This is his epiphany

about the nature of relations. He reads something taking from his pocket from which as the readers we learn what has happened to Mrs. Sinico. We learn that after the break-up in a cold weather, she dies. Her tragic death is the painful incident for Mr. Duffy. From the paper how she died is disclosed: "While attempting to cross the line, was knocked down by the engine of the ten o'clock slow train" (Joyce, 2011, p. 103). She is dead and this is a legacy for Mr. Duffy which is a burden that he will have to bear it until the end of his life. He returns to his ordinary life with no social networks. Torchiana assumes that Mr. Duffy's character is represented by a railway engine and explains his character:

The iron, the black and red colours, the white resembling puffing smoke, the engineer's mirror, the lamp and fender; however, make the image important, coming at first and unmistakable as a clue to his character. From this spiritless, orderly, cell-like abode, Mr. Duffy sets forth daily, a rather determined, one tract, iron purposed knight, for his adventures life in a private bank (Torchiana, 1987, p. 168).

Concerning the epiphanic moment it is in the last paragraph of the story:

He turned back the way he had come, the rhythm of the engine pounding in his ears. He began to doubt the reality of what memory told him. He halted under a tree and allowed the rhythm to die away. He could not feel her near him in the darkness nor her voice touch his ear. He waited for some minutes listening. He could hear nothing: the night was perfectly silent. He listened again: perfectly silent. He felt that he was alone (Joyce, 2011, p. 107).

The last line reveals accepting of a truth. This time an epiphany is a conception that we are all alone. James Joyce uses epiphanies through ordinary people; however, the background of the character is never neglected. The epiphanies of his characters are ornamented with regards to their personal comprehension. In this story, Mr. Duffy has a revelation of the nature rather than a situation. Other the other hand; Joyce's paralysis is turned into paralysis of senses. Here Mr. Duffy has a paralysis of audible as he "cannot hear anything". In this story apart from the last line actually epiphanies

are presented step by step like the accumulation of knowledge. Beck signifies the epiphanic moment as follows:

Mr. Duffy is to go one more step, from an empty epiphany to a kind of paralysis. The laborious rhythm of a train leaving Dublin reiterated for him the syllables of her name, but as "he turned back the way he had come" he began to doubt the reality of what memory told him." The suppressed acknowledgement which has struck first his stomach, then his nerves, and finally his full consciousness had become so painful that they must be put down once more, with that selective amnesia which is the ego's defense and in which he was already so practised (Beck, 1969, p. 235).

The place of doomed man in this universe is presented by Mr. Duffy, who is aware of his position. Leonard explains his loneliness:

Mr. Duffy restores the myth that he is a lone figure, a closed-circuit corpus of self-serving third sentiments built upon the corpse of Mrs. Sinico: He felt that he was alone (Leonard, 1993, p. 125).

The painful case for Mr. Duffy is not only the endurance to the death of Mrs. Sinico but also endurance to life. The loneliness for him is like a circle; the loneliness is evitable.

3.2.12 Pok! in *Ivy Day in the Committee Room*

This is the first of the four stories on public life which is written in third-person narration. From this story public life of Dublin is presented. On the other hand, this story was James Joyce's favourite story: "It is the story after (*Ivy Day in the Committee Room*) which pleases me most" (Stuart & Ellmann & Gilbert, p. 88).

Ivy day is the anniversary (1891) for Irish nationalist Charles Stewart Parnell which is celebrated on the 6th October. On that day his retentive followers commemorate him by wearing ivy leaf (Gifford, 1967, New York p. 57). Parnell is very important for Irish people as he struggled for his nation. Gifford signifies Parnell's importance for Irish people as follows:

Parnell a Protestant and a landlord with all the appearance of an English gentleman, was deeply and bitterly convinced of the injustice of the English treatment of Ireland took measures to force consideration of Irish Home Rule in the British Parliament (Gifford, 1967, p. 57).

The story takes place in a committee room where a campaign for election is held. It is a cold day and people working for the campaign gather in this room. Old Jack, who is complaining about his son, is presented following Mr. O' Connor, who works for Publican Richard J. Tierney. Thereafter, Mr. Hynes joins the conversation. As the reminder the importance of the day ivy leaf is wore by Mr. O'Connor and Mr. Hynes in their lapels.

In the room while they are trying to avoid cold by fire which is almost inactive much as all the characters, they discuss candidates for the election: Publican Richard J. Tierney vs. Bricklayer Colgan.

It is because Colgan's a working-man you say that? What's the difference between a good honest bricklayer and a publican—eh? Hasn't the working-man as good a right to be in the Corporation as anyone else—ay, and a better right than those shoneens that are always hat in hand before any fellow with a

handle to his name? Isn't that so, Mat?" said Mr. Hynes, addressing Mr. O'Connor. "I think you're right," said Mr. O'Connor.

"One man is a plain honest man with no hunker-sliding about him. He goes in to represent the labour classes. This fellow you're working for only wants to get some job or other."

"Of course, the working-classes should be represented," said the old man (Joyce, 2011, p. 111).

As their conversation goes, other people working for the election campaign get into the room. One of them is Mr. Henchy, who blames Mr. Hynes for being a spy when he is out. Here James Joyce might draw attention to spies gathering intelligence for the British. Inactivity sheds on the room from the beginning despite the importance of the day.

What makes a move in the story is when Mr. Hynes recites a poem "The Death of Parnell". Fagnoli and Gillespie suggest the importance of the place of poem in the story as follows:

"By putting the poem at the end of the story, Joyce reinforces the reader's experience of twin modes of ambivalence and ambiguity that play such important roles in his work. The pedestrian quality of the verses points toward the simplistic nostalgic view of Parnell that sustains Hynes and the others" (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 2006 p. 68).

James Joyce reflects family, nationalism and religion issues of his period and he takes nationalism in this story. The paralyzed city, Dublin is now presented how the common People gathering in the committee room remember the day but forget the importance of it.

As regards the epiphanic moment in the story it is when the people in the committee room listen to Mr. Hynes' recitation. James Joyce's use of epiphany differs from the previous stories as the epiphany in this story as well as in the other stories on public life is a revelation for public rather than a person. It seems that the

voice coming from Mr. Hynes' beer bottle accompany the revelation of the essence of ivy; "symbolic of regeneration" (Gifford, p. 57).

3.2.13 Missing Four Shillings in *A Mother*

The second story about public life, *A Mother* different from *Ivy Day in the Committee Room*, mostly focuses on one character, and presents the delusion of a character in public. Coleman suggests the following on public life stories:

In *Ivy Day in the Committee Room*, *A Mother*, and *Grace* Joyce examines three different, but often intertwined, facets of the Irish cultural imagination. They are, respectively, the political, the artistic and the religious imaginations. In each story, however, his method is more or less the same, insofar as he divides reader attention amongst several characters and, in so doing, gives voice to several perspectives (Coleman, 1991).

Although it is a story about public life as he himself stated so, the focal point is Mrs. Kearney. James Joyce chooses mother as an archetype. Mrs. Kearney's attitude towards her daughter is protective, caring and prudent until she loses her control. Upon her losing control, Mrs. Kearney reveals her hypocrisy. James Joyce's relation with his mother was no exception as containing all archetypes of a mother. In fact, according to Anderson the bond between them was "deeply emotional". (Anderson, 1998). It was his mother, who "kissed him and wept, and told him not to speak to the rough boys" when he enrolled Clongowes Wood College (Anderson, 1998, p. 15). They correspond and in one of letters epiphany intersects mother affection:

I only wish I was near you to look after and comfort you.' And ego feeding apologies: 'My dear Jim if you are disappointed in my letter and if as usual I fail to understand what you would wish to explain, believe me it is not from any want of longing desire to do so ... but as you so often said I am stupid and cannot grasp the great thoughts which are yours" (Anderson, 1998 p. 37).

In the story, Mrs. Kearney, who is Kathleen's mother, is represented very dominant and the reason for it is explained in the story:

"They thought they had only a girl to deal with and that, therefore, they could ride roughshod over her. But she would show them their mistake. They

wouldn't have dared to have treated her like that if she had been a man. But she would see that her daughter got her rights: she wouldn't be fooled" (Joyce, 2011, pp. 137, 138).

However, the dominance prevails much earlier in fact, at the beginning of the story: "when she drew near the limit and her friends began to loosen their tongues about her, she silenced them by marrying Mr. Kearney, who was a bootmaker on Ormond Quay" (Joyce, 2011, p, 126). Lacking a "voice" to express his personality and standing in the world, Mr. Kearney has no even the right to choose, as he has been chosen by his wife and not having chosen her. He is much older than Mrs. Kearney resembles Mrs. Mooney in *The Boarding House* as they are both trying to spin their daughters' fate.

Mrs. Kearney is sent to a "good convent where she learnt music and French" Later her father sent her to Academy. With the "Irish Revival" Mrs. Kearney feels that her daughter with the help of name should get a chance. Finally her name is heard and then Mr. Holohan offers her to be an accompanist in four-concert organization and gets eight guineas. While preparing for the concerts, Mrs. Kearney is very active and helpful; however the boot is on the other foot when she cannot find anybody to pay her daughter's money.

Mrs. Kearney brought her daughter over to them, and talked to them amiably. She wanted to be on good terms with them but, while she strove to be polite, her eyes followed Mr. Holohan in his limping and devious courses. As soon as she could she excused herself and went out after him.

"Mr. Holohan, I want to speak to you for a moment," she said (Joyce, 2011, p. 133).

Afterwards, her ongoing frustration turns into a rage and she does not send her daughter to the stage unless Kathleen is paid eight guineas:

She won't go on. She must get her eight guineas."

Mr. Holohan pointed desperately towards the hall where the audience was clapping and stamping. He appealed to Mr Kearney and to Kathleen. But Mr. Kearney continued to stroke his beard and Kathleen looked down, moving the point of her new shoe: it was not her fault. Mrs. Kearney repeated:

"She won't go on without her money" (Joyce, 2011, p. 136).

This is the beginning of the revolt. Mrs. Kearney revolts against Mr. Holohan and Mr. Fitzpatric, secretary of the Society, and acts as though she knew to do cope with. Mrs. Kearney thinks she knows how to deal with public affairs. In this respect she resembles to Mrs. Mooney in *The Boarding House* in that she thinks that she knows how to deal with moral affairs. The two characters are in delusion. The delusion of Mrs. Kearney will result in her daughter's losing her career. Mrs. Kearney is the dominant member of the family and her husband and her daughter do not have any voice. They are represented as subjects as they do not have resisting power and own ideas. The first and only time Kathleen decides something for her own is when her mother gets money which lacks four shillings in total: "Now, Mr. Bell," (Joyce, 2011, p. 136). Garnier draws attention to the replacement of bank notes by musical notes (Garnier, in Power, 1997). After the first part, Mrs. Kearney insists that her daughter won't go to the stage unless she is paid four guineas. Upon Mr. Holohan and Mr. Fitzpatric's insistence on paying after the Committee meeting, Mrs. Kearney loses her control:

Her face was inundated with an angry colour and she looked as if she would attack someone with her hands"

She tossed her head and assumed a haughty voice:

"You must speak to the secretary. It's not my business. I'm a great fellow fol-the-diddle-I-do."

"I thought you were a lady," said Mr. Holohan, walking away from her abruptly (Joyce, 2011, p. 138).

Mr. Holohan's statement shows the upturned roles of women and men. Joyce portrays the dullness or deadness of Dubliners and shows how people are muted even if in their own families. Because last four stories are mirrors of public life,

epiphanies in them differ from the other stories, for the epiphanic moments seem to satisfy the readers in the last four stories. To sum up there are three epiphanic moments that help readers understand the essence of a character and situation: First one is when Mrs. Kathleen revolts and doesn't let her daughter to go to the stage unless the money is paid. The second one is mocking Mr. Holohan's words and the last but not least when she gets an answer from Mr. Holohan:

She stood still for an instant like an angry stone image and, when the first notes of the song struck her ear, she caught up her daughter's cloak and said to her husband:

"Get a cab!"

He went out at once. Mrs. Kearney wrapped the cloak round her daughter and followed him. As she passed through the doorway she stopped and glared into Mr. Holohan's face.

"I'm not done with you yet," she said.

"But I'm done with you," said Mr. Holohan.

Kathleen followed her mother meekly. Mr. Holohan began to pace up and down the room, in order to cool himself for he his skin on fire.

"That's a nice lady!" he said. "O, she's a nice lady!"

"You did the proper thing, Holohan," said Mr. O'Madden Burke, poised upon his umbrella in approval (Joyce, 2011, p. 139).

Actually, the last page is a kind of revelation for readers as it summarizes the characters' traits: Mrs. Kearney is ordering, Miss Kearney consents "meekly", Mr. Kearney does what is told. The most important epiphanic moment for Mrs. Kearney is when she has a revelation of defeat although she thinks that she has the aces. The epiphanic moment signifies defeat. The decision is given; what is Mrs. Kearney has done is not acceptable as Mr. O'Madden Burke approved with his umbrella, which Ellmann suggests that the umbrella is "the moral umbrella" (Ellmann, 2010).

3.2.14 Evaluation in *Grace*

The third story on public life, *Grace*, deals with religion issues, one of Joyce's most touched subjects. The story is narrated in third person. The story is divided into three parts. In the first part Tom Kernan's fall is taken into consideration. He is represented as a fallen man. The second part starts when his friends pay a visit to him and talk about religious subjects. The third part is when they go to Jesuit Church for purification.

The story sets out with a pitiful incident; a drunken subject Mr. Kernan. He is so drunk that he falls down in the lavatory. Mr. Kernan is presented in desperation, which continues until the end of the story. Jack Power, "man in a cycling-suit" and policeman help him stand up. When Mr. Kernan's arrives home with the help of Mr. Power, we witness the poverty and desperation in the house. Most characters represented in *Dubliners* are sunk into poverty to the extent that they are almost to go beyond hunger threshold. What Mr. Kernan wants while drinking is to forget. The trials of the characters to forget by drinking do not meet their intent rather worsens the situation. A quick look at his family shows the helplessness which now pass to his children by his irresponsible behaviour. As for his wife, she is described as "active and practical woman". Although she is angry with his husband she thinks that "There were worse husbands. He had never been violent since the boys had grown up" (Joyce, 2011, p. 146). Beck evinces that the characters are typical Dubliners "economically beset, culturally restricted, liable to domestic discord, dependent on drink and masculine fellowship" (Beck, 1969, pp. 277-278).

Poverty is rampant by Mr. Power from any inch of Mr. Kernan's house. However, Mr. Kernan's situation has deteriorated or declined lately, he was successful then. Joyce shows the decline with it is result; ascent. A person's decline at work means an ascent for another:

“The arc of his social rise intersected the arc of his friend's decline, but Mr. Kernan's decline was mitigated by the fact that certain of those friends who had known him at his highest point of success still esteemed him as a character. Mr. Power was one of these friends. His inexplicable debts were a byword in his circle; he was a debonair young man. (Joyce, 2011, p. 144).

When he falls in the lavatory, he bites his tongue, so he lives through a verbal paralysis. In *Dubliners* paralysis is not confined in the thoughts, but senses and the ways of expression, as well. His wife cares for him and his friends, Mr. Cunningham, Mr. M'Coy and Mr. Power pay him a visit. Martin Cunningham, Mr. Power's colleague, is a respected man. However, he had some problems which Mr. Kernan is having now: “he had married an unpresentable woman who was an incurable drunkard. He had set up house for her six times; and each time she had pawned the furniture on him” (Joyce, 2011, p. 147). Mr. M'Coy, once a tenor, works for City Coroner. Joyce compares two characters' interests while answering to Mr. Kenan:

"But it's so sickening. I feel as if I wanted to retch off."

"That's the boose," said Mr. Cunningham firmly.

"No," said Mr. Kernan. "I think I caught a cold on the car. There's something keeps coming into my throat, phlegm or——"

"Mucus." said Mr. M'Coy (Joyce, 2011, p. 148).

In the second part when Mr. Kernan's friends pay a visit his home, their conversation is stuck into religious matters. Unlike other stories, *Grace* mainly focuses on religion. Mr. Kernan was a Protestant, but later he converted to be a Catholic. His friends' conversation leads to point they have planned.

Mr. Kernan was silent. The proposal conveyed very little meaning to his mind, but, understanding that some spiritual agencies were about to concern themselves on his behalf, he thought he owed it to his dignity to show a stiff neck. He took no part in the conversation for a long while, but listened, with an air of calm enmity, while his friends discussed the Jesuits (Joyce, 2011 p. 153).

His friends' plan is to take him to Jesuit Church to have purification. Although Mr. Kernan keeps quiet at first, he accepts the offer. Gifford suggests that Jesuit training is "rigorous and thoroughly intellectual" (Gifford, 1967, p. 69). Upon persuading Mr. Kernan, their session of religious affairs continue.

The third part is when they are at Church, which is nearly full of people. Whereas Father Flynn is presented in paralysis in *The Sisters*, Father Purdon is presented in power in *Grace*. They are all in the dignity of the place even M'Coy. "Even he was sensible of the decorous atmosphere and even he began to respond to the religious stimulus" (Joyce, 2011, p. 162). In the last part, no dialogue is given but Father Purdon's speech. Only a whisper by Mr. Cunningham, whose intent is to draw Mr. Kernan's attention to Mr. Harford, "the moneylender" and Michael Grimes, "the owner the owner of three pawnbroker's shops" is given (Joyce, 2011, p. 162). They are all there. Is it a satire as upon people's misdeed, will Mr. Kernan until he falls, will Mr. Harford lend money, will Michael Grimes continue pawning?

Although epiphanic moment is not explicit or not directed, in the third part Mr. Kernan lives through an epiphany as the words by Father Purdon find a kind of answer deep inside of him. Lastly, Father Purdon's last words might be thought as the understanding the importance of the self-calculation evaluation and leading him a thorough epiphany.

But one thing only, he said, he would ask of his hearers. And that was: to be straight and manly with God. If their accounts tallied in every point to say:
 "Well, I have verified my accounts. I find all well."
 But if, as might happen, there were some discrepancies, to admit the truth, to be frank and say like a man:

"Well, I have looked into my accounts. I find this wrong and this wrong. But, with God's grace, I will rectify this and this. I will set right my accounts" (Joyce, 2011, p. 164).

Many critics set a parallel between *Grace* and Dante's Inferno, Purgatorio and Paradiso. This assumption comes from Joyce's brother. One of the best signifying the relation is as follows:

Stanislaus Joyce has noted that in its broad structural design *Grace* can be read as a parody of Dante's Divine Comedy. Mr. Kernan's fall represents the descent into the inferno. His convalescence is analogous to the purgatorio. And St. Francis Xavier Church becomes a kind of paradiso. While that may well be true, given the scope of the story, this point has a rather limited interpretive significance (Fagnoli & Gillespie, 1995, p. 60).

It is deduced that the first part when Mr. Kernan falls is "Inferno", the second part is when his friend pay a visit is "Purgatorio" and the last part shown as a purification part is "Paradiso".

3.2.15 Song in *The Dead*

The last story of the book *The Dead* is the completion of the cycle. The first starts with death, however, the little boy cannot name or perceive it. On the contrary, Gabriel, the protagonist of *The Dead*, knows and feels it. The story is told in third person narration. In *The Sisters*, Joyce starts with the paralysis leading to the death of Father Flynn and through the other stories paralysis is extended in thought and senses. *The Dead* is the longest and the most elaborated story. Its main themes are paralysis, love, frustration, triviality, defeat and entrapment.

The doors to the dead are opened by Lily, who does households for Julia and Kate Morkan, host for the party. The story as many of the other stories in *Dubliners* takes place at night. This time not only the darkness shed on the characters but also snow prevails with its harshness. Unlike the other stories in *Dubliners*, poverty is not rampant. The characters are from bourgeois class. To start with, the protagonist Gabriel Conroy is an educated man who teaches and writes literary reviews. "Gabriel is not a great artist but a less exceptional and only partially alienated figure" (Parrinder, 2005, p. 67). Critics are of the opinion that he is Leopold Bloom in *Ulysses*. Upon his arrival, his dialogue with Lily meets with blush on his face, and he avoids answering or commenting on Lily's claim that men are "palaver". It is clear that his dialogues are mostly with women, he is not seen much talking to men. As regards Joyce's choice of his name Gifford thinks that Joyce borrowed it from Bret Harte's novel *Gabriel Conroy*:

an uncouth but gentle giant, of superb physique, but modest and diffident in manner and perfectly simple and sincere in character." He escapes from Starvation Camp in the Sierras (California) with his little sister Olly and takes a squatter's claim at One Horse Gulch, where he finds a little gold and where he earns a reputation as a nurse for the sick. Mine. Devarges, a divorcee and adventuress, learns of the presence of silver on Gabriel's claim and, assuming the name of Grace (a variant of Gretta?) Conroy (Gabriel's sister, who is the real owner of the property by inheritance from Dr. Paul Devarges) begins proceedings against Gabriel, but, being saved by him from drowning, changes

her mind and marries him instead. The silver is found, and Gabriel becomes rich. He is accused of killing his wife's former suitor and accomplice, Victor Ramirez, and does all in his power to sacrifice himself in order to save his wife, whom he believes to be the guilty person; but on the testimony of Henry Perkins, alias Henry Devargès, he is acquitted. Gabriel had married primarily to give his little sister a female companion, but the birth of a child draws him toward his wife, who has loved him for some time although her original motives in marrying him were purely selfish (Gifford, 1967 p. 74).

At the end of the story Gretta Conroy's, Gabriel's wife, dead lover is disclosed. However, as in the Harte's novel will Gabriel kill the dead lover of Gretta or the story will be introverted? When we turn back to dance event, Joyce's use of music is important as it does not last through the story even in the last part although it is not heard. Avery exposes the importance of music as follows:

If we listen as well, we notice that the text includes more than acute perceptions of musical sounds; the narrator also pointedly characterizes the tone of spoken words to indicate nuances of meaning (Avery, 1996, in Scholes R. & Litz, A. W., p. 409).

Also, the dominance and its lasting effect of music result in both Gretta and Gabriel's epiphanies. The conversations are ceased according to it and applauses are far from appreciating it. On the other hand; throughout the story Gabriel lives through paralysis of audible as he doesn't hear or appreciate the music.

During the dance, Gabriel and Miss Ivors, whom he was together at university have an argument:

"I have a crow to pluck with you."

"With me?" said Gabriel.

She nodded her head gravely.

"What is it?" asked Gabriel, smiling at her solemn manner.

"Who is G. C.?" answered Miss Ivors, turning her eyes upon him.

Gabriel coloured and was about to knit his brows, as if he did not understand, when she said bluntly:

"O, innocent Amy! I have found out that you write for The Daily Express. Now, aren't you ashamed of yourself?"

"Why should I be ashamed of myself?" asked Gabriel, blinking his eyes and trying to smile.

"Well, I'm ashamed of you," said Miss Ivors frankly. "To say you'd write for a paper like that. I didn't think you were a West Briton." (Joyce, 2011, p. 177).

Miss Ivors holds the opinion that writing for *The Daily Express* is a kind of treachery as it "opposes Irish aspiration" and resembling him to West Briton grounds on the same reason as West Briton, "who accepted Ireland's status as the West of England" (Gifford, 1967, pp. 76-77). As their conversation during the dance goes on, readers witness Gabriel's losing his ties with his homeland:

"O, Mr. Conroy, will you come for an excursion to the Aran Isles this summer? We're going to stay there a whole month. It will be splendid out in the Atlantic. You ought to come. Mr. Clancy is coming, and Mr. Kilkelly and Kathleen Kearney. It would be splendid for Gretta too if she'd come. She's from Connacht, isn't she?"

"Her people are," said Gabriel shortly.

"But you will come, won't you?" said Miss Ivors, laying her warm hand eagerly on his arm.

"The fact is," said Gabriel, "I have just arranged to go——"

"Go where?" asked Miss Ivors.

"Well, you know, every year I go for a cycling tour with some fellows and so——"

"But where?" asked Miss Ivors.

"Well, we usually go to France or Belgium or perhaps Germany," said Gabriel awkwardly.

"And why do you go to France and Belgium," said Miss Ivors, "instead of visiting your own land?"

"Well," said Gabriel, "it's partly to keep in touch with the languages and partly for a change."

"And haven't you your own language to keep in touch with—Irish?" asked Miss Ivors.

"Well," said Gabriel, "if it comes to that, you know, Irish is not my language."

.....

"And haven't you your own land to visit," continued Miss Ivors, "that you know nothing of, your own people, and your own country?"

"O, to tell you the truth," retorted Gabriel suddenly, "I'm sick of my own country, sick of it!"

"Why?" asked Miss Ivors.

Gabriel did not answer for his retort had heated him.

"Why?" repeated Miss Ivors.

They had to go visiting together and, as he had not answered her, Miss Ivors said warmly: "Of course, you've no answer" (Joyce, 2011, pp. 178-179).

It is evident that Gabriel has lost not only the ties but also he rejects his roots. Although Gabriel seems to have started denying his roots, his wife, Gretta, seems to be reconciled with her roots. Beck introduces as follows:

Gretta is also very Irish, delightfully so, and in a completely womanly way. She is both animated and self-possessed, capable of allowing her husband's uneasiness in his gruff resistance to what of Ireland is most native to her. Inclined to gaiety, she is capable of pity too and is sensitive to the party's sad undertones, which come to a privately rooted crises of feeling for her because of the song (Beck, 1969, p. 311).

Unlike almost all women in *Dubliners*, who are ineffective, trivial and neglected by men, Gretta, with the disclosure of her secret, becomes the focal character as a woman in the story. During the event when Bartell D'Arcy sings a song called *The Lass of Aughrim*, it takes Gretta to the past, in which a sacrifice for a lover will unfold.

After the party, Conroys with the other guests leave the house. Although it is morning, it is dark, which is foreshadowing of Gabriel's situation. The last part of the story takes place at a hotel, where Conroys will spend the night. Whereas Gabriel desires his wife, Gretta's mind is occupied with an experience from her past.

"Gretta, dear, what are you thinking about?"

She did not answer nor yield wholly to his arm. He said again, softly:

"Tell me what it is, Gretta. I think I know what is the matter. Do I know?"

She did not answer at once. Then she said in an outburst of tears:

"O, I am thinking about that song, *The Lass of Aughrim*"

.....

"What about the song? Why does that make you cry?"

She raised her head from her arms and dried her eyes with the back of her hand like a child. A kinder note than he had intended went into his voice.

"Why, Gretta?" he asked.

"I am thinking about a person long ago who used to sing that song" (Joyce, 2011, pp. 207-208).

At first Gabriel does not conceive the seriousness of the issue however, as he conceives it makes him angry. Through their dialogue, it is understood that the boy, Michael Furey, Gretta talking about is dead. Gabriel still touches on his status and he learns that he was a worker, but in the deeper of the secret, there is another truth: “I think he died for me, she answered” (Joyce, 2011, pp. 209-210). From Gretta’s words now it is clear that Michael Furey died or sacrificed himself just to see Gretta.

The end of the story is antipodal contrast to the beginning of the story. At the beginning of the story despite the noise and rush in the house, quietness is shed at the hotel room. Whereas snow was “cold and even hostile” in the beginning, now it “develops of warmth of expanded consciousness” (Tate, in Scholes & Litz, 1996, p. 394). The end itself has some contrasts; Gabriel is educated and in bourgeois class while Michael Furey was a worker and uneducated. Whereas Michael Furey had the real love, which results in his death, Gabriel has not even felt such an emotion.

From the moment of remembering of the song and the end of confession can be called as Gretta’s epiphany. The story takes place just before January 6th, Epiphany. Joyce reinforces his use of epiphany by intersecting the day epiphany and epiphany as a literary device. As regards the protagonist’s epiphany, it comes just after generous tears come from his eyes. The word “generous” is transcended from his wife’s statement for him upon her learning that he has lent some money to Malins (Burke, in Scholes & Litz, 1996). “You are a very generous person, Gabriel,” she said (Joyce, 2011, p. 206). Moreover; Torchiana touches on transcend within the stories: “Gabriel is released from the fate of the boy in *The Sisters*, the original fate of the priest spelled out by three old women” (Torchiana, 1987, p. 252). Thus, after Gretta sleeps it is possible that epiphany transcends to Gabriel. As characteristics of Joyce’s epiphany, Gabriel lives through a revelation:

A few light taps upon the pane made him turn to the window. It had begun to snow again. He watched sleepily the flakes, silver and dark, falling obliquely against the lamplight. The time had come for him to set out on his journey westward. Yes, the newspapers were right: snow was general all over Ireland. It was falling on every part of the dark central plain, on the treeless hills,

falling softly upon the Bog of Allen and, farther westward, softly falling into the dark mutinous Shannon waves. It was falling, too, upon every part of the lonely churchyard on the hill where Michael Furey lay buried. It lay thickly drifted on the crooked crosses and headstones, on the spears of the little gate, on the barren thorns. His soul swooned slowly as he heard the snow falling faintly through the universe and faintly falling, like the descent of their last end, upon all the living and the dead” (Joyce, 2011, p. 213).

The movement of snow symbolizes his move from the hotel room to spiritual lands as “wanderings of a mind falling asleep”, which Parrinder resembles to Ibsen's dramatic catastrophe (Parrinder, 2005, p. 67). He finds the truth in a “most delicate and evanescent of moment”. He deeply feels that even he is dead, Michael Furey is much more than he is to Gretta. As Michael Furey becomes alive, he becomes dead.

CONCLUSION

As one of the most influential writers, James Joyce uses some techniques that put him into avant-garde. He uses psychological experience. Although this is not a new concern, the technique that he used to express the experience makes him unique. The stream of conscious technique in the form of interior monologues gives us the abstract manifestation of the mind. Apart from this technique and form mostly used in “Ulysses”, the subject of this thesis epiphany, as James Joyce’s artistic comprehension, makes him unique in the world of fiction.

It is out of question to assume a modernist writer who is deaf to his/her period. James Joyce reflects family, nationalism and religion issues of his period. As James Joyce stated: “I want to give a picture of Dublin so complete that if the city suddenly disappeared from the earth it could be reconstructed out of my book”. He gives a portrait of Dublin through the inner world of his characters. In *Dubliners* the characters are filled with alienation, frustration and lack of communication, which is typical for people living in Dublin. However, by doing it he also remarks as follows: “I’ve put in so many enigmas and puzzles that it will keep the professors busy for centuries arguing over what I meant, and that’s the only way of insuring one’s immortality.” As he himself stated, it is confusing at first glance as the techniques he uses in *Dubliners*. The inner thoughts of the characters surpass the period they live as they share some features that we deeply feel. Besides, characters provide an honest picture of their own characters. Although these stories seem to be separated from each other at first glance, they are sequenced or transitive stories. To illustrate, the little boy in *The Sisters* seems to be Gabriel in *The Dead*.

Paralysis is prevalent from the first story to the last one. Upon starting with a physical paralysis in *The Sisters*, Joyce uses paralysis of senses in other stories. In *The Boarding House*, Mr. Doran because of his dimmed glasses he cannot see the truth, so it is a visual paralysis. In *Counterparts* Farrington doesn’t hear his son, which reminds us paralysis of the audible. In *Clay* when Marry touches the clay, she

cannot realize it, which signifies paralysis of tactile. In *Grace* Mr. Kernan's tongue is paralysed as he has bitten it off. Other than paralysis of senses moral, religion collective memory and nationalism are paralysed.

Characters in the stories live through moments of epiphany which are either personal or collective about a truth that they cannot see because of the paralysis by which they are afflicted. What makes epiphanies unique is the illumination moments – that we may also refer to as self-realizations or revelations – of the characters. However, the epiphany does not necessarily mean or imply that it would result in or determine the development of the character.

In this respect, we believe that a table about the epiphanies of all the characters from all the 15 short-stories would be mostly revelatory. This table shows the aspects of the condition of modern man and those of paralysis in a period of crisis in the history of humanity and the relation of these aspects to epiphany and as being under the impact of epiphany.

Also, the following explanations are needed concerning the terms used in the table, and which represent, we believe, our own attempt at defining epiphany and providing critical assumptions from the Joycean perspective as revealed in his short fiction:

(1) by “aspects of paralysis” we mean the problems, failures, and, on the whole, all the negative aspects of existence of the modern individual;

(2) by “epiphanization” we attempt, actually, to define “epiphany” in Joycean sense: we use the term “epiphanization” because we consider epiphany to imply a movement, an action, and, in this respect, it means the experience of epiphany (epiphanic experience). The epiphanic experience is both a process and an outcome, where the process is a temporal reality involving the life of the character leading to the outcome, that is, the moment of realization and revelation, and which consists in deep and strong spiritual, emotional and psychological understanding about the

personal status. By “type” we consider a twofold perspective as collective and private.

(3) by “acquired understanding” we mean the truth that the character discovers and learns about himself/herself in the process of the epiphanic experience, and which contains a symbolical significance for the whole existence.

Table: The condition of the modern character as revealed through the epiphanic experience.

Title of the short-story	Aspects of the condition of modern man	Aspects of paralysis	The type of epiphany	The acquired understanding
<i>The Sisters</i>	Childhood	Motionlessness, intangibility, obliteration of senses (namely, audible)	Private	Death
<i>An Encounter</i>	Childhood	Frustration, isolation, failure to communicate	Private	Inescapability
<i>Araby</i>	Childhood	Nonfulfillment, frustration	Private	Inevitability
<i>Eveline</i>	Adolescence	Motionlessness, frustration, lack of communication, obliteration of senses (namely, voice)	Private	Inescapability
<i>After The Race</i>	Adolescence	Triviality, alienation, loneliness, powerlessness, obliteration of senses (namely, taste in a metaphorical sense: "taste of life")	Private	Unawareness
<i>Two Gallants</i>	Adolescence	Betrayal, triviality, failure to establish relationships, moral values, alienation	Private	Loss of human values
<i>The Boarding House</i>	Adolescence	Hypocrisy, powerlessness, lack of communication, obliteration of senses (namely, vision)	Private	Entrapment in the values of society
<i>A Little Cloud</i>	Maturity	Alienation, frustration, obliteration of senses (namely, voice)	Private	Inescapability
<i>Counterparts</i>	Maturity	Oppression, frustration,	Private	Victimization

		obliteration of senses (namely, audible)		
<i>Clay</i>	Maturity	Frustration, forgetfulness, obliteration of senses (namely, tactile)	Private	Lack of love
<i>A Painful Case</i>	Maturity	alienation, frustration, failure to communicate, failure to establish relationships (namely, love), obliteration of senses (namely, audible)	Private	Loneliness
<i>Ivy Day in the Committee Room</i>	Public life	Collective memory loss, politics failure, nationalism, alienation	Collective	Memorisation
<i>A Mother</i>	Public life	Hypocrisy, artistic failure, frustration, delusion, obliteration of senses (namely, voice)	Collective	Defeat
<i>Grace</i>	Public life	Frustration, failure, religion	Collective	Self-evaluation
<i>The Dead</i>	Public life	Artistic failure, nationalism, frustration, delusion, obliteration of senses (namely, audible)	Private & Collective	Death

As it can be seen in the table, paralysis is infused in all 15 short stories. Paralysis runs rampant in the stories and it transcends from a story to another. Joyce's characters in *Dubliners* are overwhelmed by it. In *Dubliners* paralysis of frustration, alienation, national and religious issues and senses make it difficult for James his characters to realize the truth. His ordinary characters realize their situation in personal or in family or public circle. This realization does not necessarily lead to a personal development rather get the characters to stick on their inescapability in the swirl of the communal life.

In this thesis, we have tried to provide background information about epiphany concerning its origin and the usage in literary world, and, finally, to disclose James Joyce's understanding and usage of it. As the practical argumentation of his emphasis and application of epiphany, all 15 short stories in the book *Dubliners* have been individually and comparatively approached in our attempt to provide a complex insight into James Joyce's artistic credo.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, C. G. (1998). James Joyce, Yayın evi: Thames & Hudson.
- Arndt, W. F. & Gingrich, F.W & Danker F. W., (1958). A Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament and Other Early Christian Literature, 2nd ed. Chicago, IL: U. of Chicago Press.
- Attridge, D. (1990). The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce, Cambridge University Press Cambridge, 1990.
- Baker, J. R. & Thomas F. S. (1969). James Joyce's Dubliners: A Critical Handbook, 1969.
- Barfoot, C.C. (1999). Milton Silent Came Down My Path: The Epiphany of Blake's Left Foot.
- Barfoot, C.C. (1999). Moments of Moment Aspects of the Literary Epiphany, Amsterdam – Atlanta, GA.
- Beck, W. (1969). Joyce's Dubliners: Substance, Vision, And Art, Duke University Press Durham N.C.
- Beja, M. (1992). James Joyce: A Literary Life, Ohio State University Press, Columbus.
- Beja, M. (1973). James Joyce, Dubliners and A Portrait of the Artist as a Young Man: A Selection of Critical Essays, Macmillan, London.
- Beja, M. (1971). Epiphany in the Modern Novel. University of Washington Press, Seattle.
- Belge, M. (1994). Edebiyat üzerine yazılar YKB Yayınları.
- Benstock, B. (1977). James Joyce: The Undiscover'd Country, Gill and Macmillan, Dublin, Barnes & Noble Books, New York .

- Benstock, B. (1985). *James Joyce*, Frederick Ungar. New York .
- Benstock, B. (1985). *Critical Essays on James Joyce*, G.K. Hall & Co. Boston.
- Bernard, G (1991). *Coleman Imagination, Illusion and Vision in James Joyce's Dubliners* McMaster University Canada.
- Bidley, M. (1997). *Patterns of Epiphany From Wordsworth to Tolstoy, Pater and Barrett Browning*, Southern Illinois University Press.
- Bosinelli B. M. R. & Jr. Mosher, F.H. (1998). *ReJoycing New Reading of Dubliners*, The University Press of Kentucky.
- Briggs, R. T. (2003). *Dubliners and Joyce an Epiphany* Wichita State University USA.
- Bugden, F. (1972), *James Joyce and the Making of Ulysses and Other Writings*, Oxford University Press, London.
- Bulson, E. (2006). *The Cambridge Introduction to James Joyce* Cambridge University Press New York
- Bulson, E. (2004). *Topics and Geographies In Rabaté M.J. Palgrave Advances in James Joyce Studies*
- Chestnutt, Margaret. *Joyce's Dubliners: History, Ideology, and Social Reality*, *Eire-Ireland* 14 (1979): 93–105.
- Church, M. (1983). *Structure and Theme Don Quixote to James Joyce*, Ohio State University Press, Columbus
- Connolly, T. E. (1965). *Joyce's "The Sisters": A Pennyworth of Snuff*, *College English*, Vol. 27, No. 3 pp. 189-195.
- Connor, S. (1996). *James Joyce*. Northcote House, England.
- Delaney, F. (1982). *James Joyce's Odyssey*. Hodder and Stoughton, London.

Deming, R. H. (1977). *A Bibliography of James Joyce Studies*, Hall & Co., Boston.

Dunleavy, Janet E. (1991). *Reviewing Classics of Joyce Criticism*, University of Press.

Joyce, J. (2011). *Dubliners*, Harper Press.

Elka – Georget, I. (2012). *The Vocational self. A study of James Joyce's epiphany from Dubliners to a Portrait*, doctoral Thesis , Universitatea din Craiova Craiova.

Ellmann, R. & Litz, A. W. & Ferguson, J. W. (1991). *James Joyce Poems and Shorter Writing* Yayın: Faber and Faber.

Ellmann, R. (1982). *James Joyce*. Oxford University Press, New York.

Ellmann, R. (1977). *The Consciousness of Joyce*, Faber and Faber, London.

Ellmann, M. (2010). *The Nets of Modernism: Henry James, Virginia Woolf, James Joyce, and Sigmund Freud*. Cambridge.

Emerson, R. W. (1960). *Selections from Ralph Waldo Emerson*, ed. Stephen E. Whicher, Boston: MA.

Erol, B. (2012). *One Day James Joyce*, Hacettepe University, Bizim Büro, Ankara.

Fargnoli, A. N. & Gillespie M. P. (1995). *James Joyce A to Z: The Essential Reference to the Life and Work*, Oxford University Press.

Fargnoli, A. N. & Gillespie M. P. (2006). *Critical Companion to James Joyce: A Literary Reference to His Life and Work*. Facts On File, Inc..

Fargnoli, A. N. (2003). *James Joyce: A Literary Reference*, Carroll & Graf, New York.

French, M. (1978). *Missing Pieces in Joyce's Dubliners*. *Twentieth Century Literature* 24 pp. 443–472.

- Friedrich, G. & Walzl, F. L. (1961). Joyce's Pattern of Paralysis in Dubliners
 Author(s): College English, Vol. 22, No. 7.
- Garnier, M.D in Power. (1997). From Paralysis To Para-lire: Another Reading of A
Mother, Amsterdam – Atlanta GA.
- Garry Leonard, G. (1993). Detective and The Cowboy: Desire, Gender, and
 Perversion in “An Encounter” in Reading Dubliners Again: A Lacanian
 Perspective The University Press, New York.
- Georgeta, I. E. (2012). The Vocational Self. A study of James Joyce’s Epiphany
 From Dubliners To A Portrait. Doctoral dissertation, Craiova.
- Gerhard Friedrich, G. (1995). The Perspective of Joyce’s Dubliners. College English
 Vol. 26.
- Gifford, D. (1967). Notes For Joyce Dubliners and A Portrait of the Artist as a
 Young Man, E.P. Dutton & Co., Inc., .
- Giles, J. in Power. (1997). From Paralysis To Para-lire: Another Reading of A
Mother, Amsterdam – Atlanta GA.
- Gillespie, G. (2003). Proust, Mann, Joyce in the Modernist Context, , D.C. Catholic
 University of America Press, Washington.
- Gillet, L. (1958). Claybook for James Joyce. Arden Library, New York.
- Golban, P. (2008). A short History of Literary Criticism, Üç Mart Press.
- Goldman, A. (1966). The Joyce Paradox, Routledge & Kegan Paul, London.
- Harari, R. (2002) How James Joyce Made His Name: A Reading of the Final Lacan,
 Other Press, New York.
- Hart, C. (1969). James Joyce’s Dubliners: Critical Essays, Viking, New York.
- Harwood, W. (2006). Dictionary of contemporary mythology, book Surge
 publishing, revised edition.

- Hays, J. D. & Duvall, J. S. & Pate, C. M. (2007). *Dictionary of Biblical Prophecy and End Times*.
- Hero, S. (1963). *New Directions*. New York.
- Heller, V. (1995). *Joyce, Decadence, and Emancipation*, University of Illinois Press, Urbana.
- Hodgart, M. (1978). *J. C. James Joyce: A Student's Guide*, Routledge, London. 1978.
- Igoe, Vivien. (1990). *James Joyce's Dublin Houses & Nora Barnacle's Galway*, London.
- Ingersoll, E. G. (1996). *Engendered Trope in Joyce's Dubliners*. Southern Illinois University Press.
- John Francis Hart J. H. (2007). *Oscillation in Literary Modernism*, Peter Lang.
- Joyce, S. (2003). *My Brother's Keeper: James Joyce's Early Years* Da Capo Press.
- Kain, R. (1972). *M. Dublin in the Age of William Butler Yeats and James Joyce*. David and Charles, England.
- Kearney, R. (2005). *Epiphanies in Joyce and Proust*, *The new Arcadia Review*, Volume 3.
- Kenner, H. (1956). *Dublin's Joyce*, Chatto and Windus, London 1956.
- Kavas, L. (1996). *Epiphanies: Anıklıklar, Altıkırkbeş Yayın, İstanbul*.
- Khan, S. A. (2013). *William Wordsworth, James Joyce and E. M. Forster: The Romantic Notion of Education and Modern Fiction*, University of Sussex.
- Kim, S. (2012). *Literary Epiphany in the Novel, 1850-1950: Constellations of the Soul*, which Palgrave Macmillan.

Kimball, J. (2003). *Joyce and the Early Freudians: A Synchronic Dialogue of Texts*. University Press of Florida.

Langbaum, R. (1999). *The Epiphanic Mode in Wordsworth and Modern Literature*, in *Moments of Moment Aspects of the Literary Epiphany* Edited by Wim Tigges, Amsterdam – Atlanta GA.

Leonard, M. Garry. (1993) *Reading Dubliners Again: A Lacanian Perspective*, University Press, New York.

Lisa Fluet, L. (2011). *Stupidity Tries: Objects, Things, and James Joyce's Clay* Dergi: Éire- Ireland Volume 46, Issue 1&2, Earrach/Samhradh / Spring/Summer 2011 p. 194 10.1353/eir.0007).

Litz, A. W. (1964). *James Joyce*, G. K. Hall, Boston, 1964.

Lodge, D. (1992). *The Art of Fiction*. Penguin Book.

López, A. & Azcá, Y. (2002). *Embers of Time a Multidisciplinary Exploration of the Crisis of Representational Time in Science and Narrative (Special Emphasis on Virginia Woolf & James Joyce)*, doctoral dissertation, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Madrid.

Luft, J. (2009). *Form and Ambiguity in James Joyce's Eveline* *The Canadian Journal of Irish Studies* Vol. 35, No. 2. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41415001> accessed on 10th of February 2013.

MA, J. (2011) *James Joyce's Epiphany and Virginia Woolf's "Moment of Importance"*. *Studies in Literature and Language* Vol. 2, No. 1.

Mahaffey, V. *Reauthorizing Joyce*, Cambridge University Press, 1988.

Mason, E. & Ellman, R. (195). *The Critical Writings of James Joyce*, New York.

Mikhail, E. H. (1990). *James Joyce: Interviews and Recollections*, Macmillan, London.

Minutiae, T. (2009). The Essence of Epiphany. <http://devilsdeeds.blogspot.com.tr> accessed on February 10, 2014.

Mitchell J. A. & Slote S. (2013). *Derrida and Joyce: Texts and Contexts*, State University of New York Press.

Natal, I. (2011). A Portrait of James Joyce's Epiphanies as a Source Text Dergi: *Humanicus* Issue: 6.

Öğretir, İ. (2005). *Edebiyatta Epifan, Sherwood Anderson'un Winesburg, Ohio'su, Çizgi Kitabevi, Konya.*

O'Brien, Edna. (1999) *James Joyce*, Viking, New York, 1999.

Palls, T. L. (1984). *Literary Epiphany in Virginia Woolf and Clarice Lispector* *Luso-Brazilian Review*. Vol.21, No.1, University of Wisconsin Press.

Parrinder, P. *James Joyce*, Cambridge University Press, 1984.

Parsons, D. (2007). *Theorists of The Modernist Novel: James Joyce, Dorothy Richardson, Virginia Woolf*, Routledge, New York.

Peake, C. H. (1977). *James Joyce: The Citizen and the Artist* Stanford University Press.

Perlis, A.D. (1980). *Beyond Epiphany: Pater's Aesthetic Hero in the Works of Joyce*, *James Joyce Quarterly* Vol. 17, No. 3, University of Tulsa.

Prescott, J. (1964). *Exploring James Joyce*, Southern Illinois University Press, USA.

Rabaté J. M. (2004). *James Joyce and The Politics of Egoism*, Cambridge University Press.

Rabaté J. M. (2004). *Palgrave Advance in James Joyce Studies*, Palgrave Macmillan.

- Pound, E. & Joyce, J. & Read F. (1970). Pound/Joyce: The Letters of Ezra Pound to James Joyce, With Pound's Critical Essays and Articles About Joyce, New Directions Publishing Corporation
- Rodopi, D. S. (1977). James Joyce's Aesthetic Theory its development and application, N.V., Amsterdam.
- Parrinder P. (2005). James Joyce, Cambridge University Press.
- Power M. & Schneider U. New Perspectives on Dubliners, Amsterdam – Atlanta GA, 1997
- Scholes, R. (2003). Robert In Search of James Joyce, Comprehensive Biography and Critical Analysis of James Joyce, Chelsea House Publishers.
- Scholes, R. & Walzl, F. L. (1967). The Epiphanies of Joyce [Elektronik versiyon], Walzl Source: PMLA, Vol. 82, No. 1. Scoff, S. V. & Kenner, H. & Scholer, R. (2003). Comprehensive Biography and Critical Analysis Bloom's BioCritiques James Joyce, Chelsea House, pub.
- Scholes R. & Litz, A. W. (1996). James Joyce Dubliners Text, Criticism and Notes Penguin Books, USA.
- Schneider, U. (1998). Titles in Dubliners, in Bosinelli B. M. R. & Jr. Mosher, F.H. ReJoycing New Reading of Dubliners (1998), The University Press of Kentucky.
- Senn, F. (1984) Joyce's Dislocutions: Essays on Reading as Translation. Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Staley, Thomas F. & Randolph L. (1993). Reflections on James Joyce: Stuart Gilbert's Paris Journal, University of Texas Press, Austin.
- Stuart & Ellmann, Gilbert, R. (1966). James Joyce Letters Volumes 1 - 2 & 3 Viking, Vol:II
- Tindall, W.Y. (1995) A Reader's Guide to James Joyce, First Syracuse University Press, USA.

Torchiana, D. T. (1987). *Backgrounds for Joyce's Dubliners The Sisters: The Three Fates and the Opening of Dubliners*, Allen & Unwin Inc.,.

Tigges, W. (1999). *The Significance of Trivial Things: Towards a Typology of Literary Epiphanies, Moments of Moment Aspects of the Literary Epiphany*, Amsterdam – Atlanta, GA.

Tigges, W. (1999). *The Epiphanic Mode in Wordsworth and Modern Literature Moments of Moment Aspects of the Literary Epiphany*, Amsterdam – Atlanta GA.

Valente, F. (1999) *Joyce's Dubliners as Epiphanies*. Accessed on 15 February 2014, http://www.themodernword.com/joyce/paper_valente.html.

Walzl, F. L. (1965). *The Liturgy of the Epiphany Seasons and the Epiphanies of Joyce*, (September 1965): 436–450.

Walzl, F. L. (1977). *James Joyce Quarterly* Vol. 14, No. 4.

Walzl, F. L. (1971). *James Joyce Quarterly* Vol. 9, No. 1, pp. 119-121. University of Tulsa Article Stable <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25486949>.

Walzl, F. L. (1982). *Dubliners: Women in Irish Society.*” In *Women in Joyce*, edited by Suzette Henke and Elaine Unkeless, 31–56. University of Illinois Press.